



Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board Minutes February 28, 2017

A Budget and Finance Committee Meeting, a Regular Meeting, and Executive Session of the Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board were scheduled to be held beginning at 5:00 p.m. at the District Support Services Center, 2411 West 14th Street, Tempe, Arizona, pursuant to ARS §38-431.07, notice having been duly given.

GOVERNING BOARD

Alfredo Gutierrez, President
Linda Thor, Secretary
Johanna Haver, Member
Jean McGrath, Member
Dana Saar, Member
Tracy Livingston, Member

Absent: Laurin Hendrix, Member

ADMINISTRATION

Maria Harper-Marinick
Barbara Basel for LaCoya Shelton
Paul Dale, Interim EVC & Provost
Gaye Murphy
Mary Lou Mosely for Paul Dale (PVC)
Edward Kelty
Christina Schultz
Chris Bustamante
Bill Guerriero
Steven Gonzales
Jan Gehler
Chris Haines
Terry Leyba-Ruiz
Ernie Lara
Shari Olson
Sasan Poureetezadi
Maggie McConnell, Legal

CALL TO ORDER OF BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING

Committee Chair Dr. Linda Thor called the Budget and Finance Committee Meeting to order at 5:05 p.m. Dr. Thor announced there was one item on the agenda, which was a review of the 2017-18 Budget.

Vice Chancellor of Business Services Gaye Murphy provided detailed information regarding the following topics (a detailed PowerPoint presentation is included with these minutes which includes the information provided):

- Projected Resources (property taxes from new construction, no tuition increase, internal reallocation, SRP)
- Potential Additional Expenditures (mandatory and high priority expenditures, employee compensation/benefits)
- Details of the FY2017-18 Proposed Budget (breakdown of funds)
- Proposed FY2017-18 Reallocations and Uses
- Operating and Capital Highlights
- Maricopa Tuition Rates (between 2007 thru 2017)
- Property Tax Perspective
- FY2017-18 Budget Adoption Schedule

Discussion Points:

- Changes in enrollment; No new money in capital; How much has to do with enrollment decline?

- What adjustments have been made to budget due to the decline in enrollment? Response: Enrollment is a self-funding process. Tuition loss is easy to calculate.
- Are we doing some to turn decline around? Response: Strengthen outreach and recruitment services. We need to attract students and also maintain students by helping them be successful.
- \$31 million could be available with tuition increase.
- Discussion about Fund Balance. We have unrestricted resources of \$400 million. These are reserved for specific purposes and bonding purposes. We have a good cushion to weather the storm.
- At a future meeting we need to look at a future bond or alternative. Property tax increase? Contingency transfer?
- FTSE has been primary focus on budget allocations. Should it be based on needs? Is there any further discussion to base it on need? New revenue plus internal reallocation cuts and increases need to be considered. Look at actual need and see if we are meeting obligations.
- Have a tax increase only for a need. We need to know what needs are. We have a very tight budget but we have choices. Need to rethink marketing efforts. Need to look into targeted populations program. Ask Presidents to give us their needs.
- Calculate what 2% tax levy would generate. Ask colleges to make recommendations on their needs. Need to relook at reallocation process.
- Special meeting of four hours should be held to discuss tax increase possibility, colleges needs, etc. We can slip on timeline but not by much.

Concluding remarks: It was decided to explore holding a four-hour special meeting on a Saturday to discuss budgetary issues.

ADJOURNMENT OF BUDGET AND FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING

The Budget and Finance Committee Meeting adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER OF REGULAR BOARD MEETING

President Alfredo Gutierrez called the Regular Board Meeting of the Maricopa Community College District to order at 6:30 p.m.

SUBSTITUTIONS

There were TWO substitutions for members of the CEC.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The assembly pledged allegiance to the United States of America led by Estrella Mountain Community College student Phylcia Ybarra.

STUDENT LIFE REPORTS

The following students from Estrella Mountain Community College came forward to present an update on their activities this semester:

Phylcia Ybarra, President of the Associated Students
Christian Ruano, Vice President of the Associated Students

Ms. Ybarra and Mr. Ruano explained that the Office of Student Life and Leadership provides an environment which fosters the social, academic and professional growth and development of the student. It serves over 400 students, faculty/staff and community member on a weekly basis. The campus serves over 20 active clubs and organizations and they have sponsored over 82 programs this academic year. The EMCC Summer Success Institute was launched in July 2016 with 33 participants. The Institute provides first year students with a jumpstart to their college experience. Through engaging and dynamic experiences, students learn how to successfully navigate the college environment. The Institute consists of four 3-hour sessions held in July. Areas of focus include campus resources, team building, communication skills, classroom etiquette, academic success strategies, diversity, leadership development, and life skills. Upcoming events will include a student success fair, a one-day student conference, the Hermanas Conference, a Women's Conference, Student Appreciation Day, and Graduation.

COLLEGE REPORTS

There were no reports.

EMERITUS, AWARDS, AND RECOGNITION

There was one presentation. This included one award for Patricia McIntyre from Phoenix College. Interim President Chris Haines approached the podium to present the award.

CITIZEN'S INTERIM

Two citizens came forward. They were Delbert Ray Sr. representing the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community who came forward to encourage the Board to approve the Cloud Song Project on the agenda this evening. Many members of their Indian Community have attended Scottsdale Community College and have successfully gone on to other options. Mr. Ray praised President Jan Gehler for her efforts to create a cultural center that will help with new economic ventures to support their tribes and provide self-sufficiency for their community.

Mr. Mark Hiegel representing the Scottsdale Chamber of Commerce came forward next to praise Scottsdale Community College for always providing a competitive edge. He expressed his support for the Cloud Song Center Project which will help keep kids coming to SCC. It provides an opportunity to go on to other Arizona universities. The new building will allow outreach and showcasing of former students.

CHANCELLOR REPORT

Transformation Task Force Update

The Chancellor requested that Darcy Renfro, Chancellor Chief of Staff, come forward to provide an overview of the Ad-Hoc Transformation Task Force Process. Ms. Renfro's presentation included the following information:

- Outreach & Communication
- Public Website Information
- Design Principles
 - Focus on student success as primary driver of system stability and success
 - Empower system to be more agile and responsive to workforce and employer needs
 - Incentivize enhanced use of resources, efficiency and collaboration

- Deploy an agile leadership structure to enhance community connections
- Values
 - Data-driven decisions
 - Full consideration of benefits and drawbacks of all proposed changes
 - Transparency and inclusiveness
- Task Force Charter
- Proposed Timeline and Process Outreach and Communication

Ms. Renfro reported that the Task Force had kicked off a very aggressive set of meetings last week. The task force included twenty members and these members would be broken down into subcommittees to break up the work. The plan at this point calls for a plan to be presented on April 24.

Update on Enrollment Management:

The Chancellor then requested that Executive Vice Chancellor and Provost Dr. Paul Dale provide a report on Enrollment. His presentation included the following:

- Enrollment statistics from 2000 – 2014/15 – Projections through 2025 both at two-year and four-year institutions
- Statistics on Greater Phoenix Unemployment to MCCCDC Enrollment during years 2005-2015
- MCCCDC FTSE Minus Recession Years
- Student Access – Existing Pipelines
- Student Enrollment Management Plan (SEM)
- Student Communication – Customer Relationship Management (CRM)
- New Student Admissions Application
- Flexible Start Dates
- Some College No Degree Campaign
- Web Redesign and Structure
- Strategic Commitments
- Student Retention

BOARD PRESIDENT REPORT

President Gutierrez announce the following committee assignments:

- Mrs. Jean McGrath – Maricopa Foundation Member for the year 2017
- Mr. Laurin Hendrix and Dr. Linda Thor – Audit and Finance Committee for 2017
- Mr. Alfredo Gutierrez – Arizona Association of District Governing Boards

APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA

Board President Gutierrez requested a motion to approve the Order of the Agenda.

MOTION

Motion 10466

Board Member Tracy Livingston requested that item 11.2, Approve Authorization by Governing Board of the President’s Involvement in the General Counsel Search, be pulled for discussion. Board Member Dana Saar requested that item 11.3, Approve Resolution Regarding Governing Board Fiduciary Responsibilities, be pulled for discussion.

Board Secretary Thor made a motion to approve the Order of the Agenda with the exception of Items 11.2 and 11.3 which would be discussed separately. Board Member Haver seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

APPROVAL OF
CONSENT AGENDA
MOTION

The following items were included on the Consent Agenda:

10.1 APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE JANUARY 6, 2017 BOARD ORIENTATION, JANUARY 10, 2017 SPECIAL SESSION, POLICY COMMITTEE, ELECTION OF OFFICERS, AGENDA REVIEW, AND LEGISLATIVE UPDATE, AND JANUARY 24, 2017 TEFRA PUBLIC HEARING AND REGULAR MEETING

11.1. APPROVE EMERITUS DISTINCTION – PHOENIX COLLEGE (PC) – PATRICIA MCINTYRE - it is recommended that the Governing Board award Emeritus Distinction to Patricia McIntyre for her meritorious contributions to the students of the Maricopa County Community College District (MCCCD). .

~~11.2. APPROVE AUTHORIZATION BY GOVERNING BOARD OF THE PRESIDENT’S INVOLVEMENT IN THE GENERAL COUNSEL SEARCH – it is recommended that the Governing Board authorize the Governing Board President to initiate and complete a search for a general counsel in concert with the Chancellor and with the assistance of the Human Resources and Legal Services Departments. PULLED FOR DISCUSSION~~

~~11.3. APPROVE RESOLUTION REGARDING GOVERNING BOARD FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITIES – it is recommended that the Governing Board adopt the following resolution: *The Governing Board’s fiduciary responsibilities are to monitor and steward the District and each of the colleges. Those responsibilities include speaking with the Chancellor, Presidents, Faculty and all staff as we feel appropriate. Everyone employed by the District is authorized to speak freely and responsibly to Board members individually and in our formal sessions.* PULLED FOR DISCUSSION~~

12.1 APPROVE TITLE I LEA GRANT 2017 – TITLE I LEA - adopt the annual Title I Grant allocation for GateWay Early College High School (GWECHS) in the amount of \$114, 885.25.

12.2 APPROVE AGREEMENT FOR DUAL ENROLLMENT WITH CHARTER SCHOOLS – authorize entry into an agreement on behalf of its college with the charter schools listed below for its dual enrollment program.

12.3 APPROVE STUDENT HEALTH ASSESSMENT DISTRICT-WIDE - accept the grant of \$15,000 from the Maricopa County Department of Public Health. The grant was made to the Maricopa County Community College District to implement the Healthy Maricopa District-wide and Wellness Assessment and develop a School Health Improvement Plan. The goal is to design an organizational model that has a holistic approach to well-being. The grant term is from March 1, 2017, to June 30, 2018. :

12.4 APPROVE MCCCD PROPOSITION 301 FISCAL YEAR 2017-2018 ANNUAL PLAN - approve the MCCCD Proposition 301 Fiscal Year 2017-

2018 Annual Plan. The plan was completed in accordance with the amended Arizona Revised Statutes, section 15-1472.

12.5 APPROVE CURRICULUM - It is recommended that the proposals be approved as submitted.

13.1 APPROVE SALE OF A PORTION OF LAND TO CITY OF LGENDALE FOR A NEW BUS STOP – GLENDALE COMMUNITY COLLEGE - approve the sale of a portion of the District property located at the southeast corner of Glendale Community College to the City of Glendale for a new bus stop. The offered purchase price for the 400 square foot parcel is \$1,102.00

13.2. APPROVE LEASE OF SUITE D103 AT RIO SOUTHERN TO PING HE AND YAHUI WANG DBA SZECHWAN NOODLE - authorize the lease of the Suite D103 (1,315 SF) located at Rio Salado College – Southern, 3330 South Price Rd., Tempe, AZ 85252 to Ping He and Yahui Wang (Szechwan). The lease term begins on March 1, 2017 and is for 60 months with an option to extend the lease for another 60 months. The monthly rate will be \$931.46 or \$8.50 per SF, triple net, for the first 12 months with annual 3% increases. The rate for the extension period will be market rate at that time. Additionally, an amount of \$274.00 per month will be charged for maintenance of common areas.

A standard reimbursement of \$1.50 per SF per year will be allowed for tenant to complete tenant improvements prior to occupying the premises.

MOTION

Motion 10467

Board Member Saar moved for approval of the Consent Agenda as amended (Items 11.2 & 11.3 pulled for discussion). Board Member Haver seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

11.2. APPROVE AUTHORIZATION BY GOVERNING BOARD OF THE PRESIDENT’S INVOLVEMENT IN THE GENERAL COUNSEL SEARCH - it is recommended that the Governing Board authorize the Governing Board President to initiate and complete a search for a general counsel in concert with the Chancellor and with the assistance of the Human Resources and Legal Services Departments.

Discussion:

Board Member Tracy Livingston commented that she knew this was a necessary task which should have two board members. The item as it read “that the Governing Board should authorize the Governing Board President to initiate and complete a search for a general counsel in concert with the Chancellor and with the assistance of the Human Resources and Legal Services Departments.” Mrs. Livingston indicated that the Chancellor needed to do this on her own. President Gutierrez responded that historically two board members are on this committee and they then recommend the candidates to the Chancellor and Board Chair. Mrs. Livingston challenged the action item in that she felt it gave the Board Chair too much power and did not mention the two board members who would be serving. It was recommended that this item be amended to read: It is recommended that the Governing Board authorize two board members -- who volunteer and not be appointed -- to initiate the process of forming a search committee in concert with the Chancellor and the assistance of the Human Resources and Legal Services Departments to

initiate and complete the search for a general counsel. (Board Members Livingston and Haver volunteered to serve.)

MOTION

Motion 10468

Board Member Livingston moved for approval of the Item 11.2. Board Member Haver seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

11.3. APPROVE RESOLUTION REGARDING GOVERNING BOARD FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITIES - it is recommended that the Governing Board adopt the following resolution: *The Governing Board's fiduciary responsibilities are to monitor and steward the District and each of the colleges. Those responsibilities include speaking with the Chancellor, Presidents, Faculty and all staff as we feel appropriate. Everyone employed by the District is authorized to speak freely and responsibly to Board members individually and in our formal sessions.*

Discussion:

Board Member Saar commented that in the actual document there are a lot of "whereas", however, the Limitations state that it is up to the Board to monitor the Chancellor's performance. In order to do this, it is up to the Board to be able to speak freely to staff and the community. This resolution will give the Board the freedom to go out to the community and campuses to do this. President Gutierrez repeated that the resolution stressed the ability for everyone employed to be able to speak freely, responsibly, and openly.

MOTION

Motion 10469

Board Member Saar moved for approval of the Item 11.3. Board Secretary Thor seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

14.1 APPROVE SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT – PHOENIX COLLEGE FACULTY MEMBER - authorize the Chancellor or her designee to prepare and execute documents necessary to resolve a claim of age discrimination asserted by former Phoenix College faculty member Dr. Barry Weingart, for a lump sum amount of \$110,000 in accordance with the terms presented to and discussed with the Governing Board in an email dated February 3, 2017, and to make the disbursements required by the terms of the agreement.

MOTION

Motion 10470

Board Secretary Thor moved for approval of the Item 14.1. Board Member Haver seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

15.1 APPROVE AWARD OF CONTRACT FOR INSURANCE BROKERAGE AND RISK MANAGEMENT CONSULTANT SERVICES – approve the award of a contract of insurance and risk management consultant services to Aon Risk Solutions for the period of March 1, 2017 to February 28, 2018 with an additional four one-year options available for a total contract period not to exceed five years.

MOTION

Motion 10471

Board Secretary Thor moved for approval of the Item 15.1. Board Member Haver seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

15.2 APPROVE FINAL GURANTEED MAXIMUM PRICE (GMP) CONTRACT AMENDMENT FOR CONSTRUCTION OF THE CLOUD SONG CENTER AT SCOTTSDALE COMMUNITY COLLEGE – approve a second Contract Amendment to an existing Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) Agreement in the amount of Eleven Million One Hundred Thirty-Six Thousand Eight Hundred Fifty-Eight Dollars and no/100ths (\$11,136,858.00) to **Okland Construction** for the construction of the New Cloud Song Center project at Scottsdale Community College

MOTION

Motion 10472

Board Secretary Thor moved for approval of the Item 15.2. Board Member Haver seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

15.3 APPROVE CONCEPTUAL APPROVAL FOR REMODELING GILA HALL AT CHANDLER-GILBERT COMMUNITY COLLEGE – PECOS CAMPUS – provide Conceptual Approval for remodeling Gila Hall at the Chandler-Gilbert Community College - Pecos Campus with a Total Project Budget of \$500,000.

MOTION

Motion 10473

Board Member Saar moved for approval of the Item 15.3. Board Member Haver seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

15.4 APPROVE PROPOSED COURSE FEE CHANGES FISCAL YEAR 2017-18 BUDGET – approve the varied course fee changes detailed on the attached submitted as an action item. These changes relate to course fees at several colleges across the district, detailed by college.

MOTION

Motion 10474

Board Member Saar moved for approval of the Item 15.4. Board Member Haver seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

15.5 APPROVE TUITION & FEES FISCAL YEAR 2017-18 – recommendations were made to the Chancellor through the District’s budget development process. The Chancellor has considered the potential impact on Maricopa Community College and the Governing Board member’s comments and therefore recommends no increase in the current county resident tuition rate of \$86.00 per credit hour. Full time students taking 30 credit hours will continue to pay \$2,580 annually. Attached is the Proposed FY 2017-18 Tuition and Fee schedule, submitted as an action to the Governing Board. Action on the proposal is requested at the February Governing Board meeting in order to ensure that any approved changes are implemented in the Student Information System prior to the start of registration for the Fall 2017 semester.

MOTION

Motion 10475

Board Member Saar moved for approval of the Item 15.5. Board Secretary Thor seconded. Motion passed 6-0 (Mr. Hendrix not in attendance).

INFORMATION ITEMS

16.1 APPROVE PROPOSED DELETION: GOVERNING BOARD POLICY 1.3 DEVELOPMENT EDUCATION – In preparation for the adoption of revised Board Policy language, it is recommended that the Governing Board delete existing Board Policy 1.3 Development Education as Amended October 22, 2013, Motion No. 10112.

16.2 APPROVE PROPOSED CHANGES: GOVERNING BOARD POLICY 1.3 DEVELOPMENT EDUCATION – adopt the proposed policy revisions that have been submitted as a result of discussions at the August 9, September 13, October 11, November 8, 2016, and January 10, 2017, Policy Committee Meetings, all dedicated to the topic of Developmental Education. Upon adoption, the revised policy changes shall replace preceding Board Policy 1.3 language and become effective for the 2017 Monitoring Cycle.

17.1 REVIEW PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR (FY) 2017-18 BUDGET – Attached for review is the Proposed FY 2017-18 Budget. The General Fund, Current Auxiliary Fund, Current Restricted Fund, and Plant Fund total \$1.4 billion. The public hearing and final adoption of the proposed budget is scheduled in March 28, 2017.

18.1 REVIEW EMPLOYMENTS (REGULAR, SHORT-TERM, AND SPECIALLY FUNDED) (JANUARY, 2017) AND SEPARATIONS (JANUARY 2017) – During this time period, there were 69 hires and 47 separations. Mrs. McGrath asked for an accounting of why there were increases in hirings when the number of students were decreasing.

MONITORING REPORTS

19.1 REVIEW BUDGET ANALYSIS REPORT, FUND 1 – GENERAL UNRESTRICTED FUND, FOR THE SEVEN MONTHS ENDING JANUARY 31, 2016 - Expenditure analysis indicates 47.3% of the budget has been expended this year as compared to 47.3% expended at this same point last year. 26.4% of the budget remained unexpended or unencumbered compared to 23.2% in the prior year. Revenue analysis indicated that 64.6% of the budgeted revenue has been recognized as compared to 63.6% in the prior year. The projected fund balance will increase by ~\$3.2M this fiscal year and the projected ending fund balance for June 2017 is \$174.7M. The District should meet its financial stability requirements.

19.2 REVIEW 2004 General Obligation Bonds Series A (2005), Series B (2007), Series C (2009), Series D (2011) and Series 2013 2004 Capital Development Plan Summary As of December 31, 2016- Attached is a Statement of GO Bond Projects as of December 31, 2016, related to the issuance of the 2004 General Obligation Bonds authorized by the voters on November 2, 2004 (Series A, B, C, D and 2013). Also included is the 2004 Capital Development Plan Summary as of December 31, 2016. Detailed documentation is maintained by the office of the Associate Vice Chancellor of Business Services & Controller. As of December 31, 2016, \$894.3 million, representing approximately 94% of proceeds from the Series A, Series B, Series C, Series D and Series 2013 issuances of the 2004 bond have been expended and \$57.0 million remains available. Bond proceeds are invested until expended.

FACULTY EXECUTIVE COUNCIL (FEC)

There was no report.

CLASSIFIED STAFF COUNCIL REPORT

Kris Bliss, President of the Classified Staff Council, provided the following comments:

President Gutierrez, Governing Board members, Chancellor Harper-Marinick, members of CEC and guests. I am presenting on behalf of the Classified Staff Council.

Thank you Governing Board members for the resolution you passed earlier this evening providing clarification that you are welcoming feedback from employees in open session. It provides me the ability and wherewithal to comfortably speak about the matter I am here to present. Chancellor Harper-Marinick, thank you for inviting feedback at the State of the District and the upcoming town halls, and for reiterating the values you hold – inclusion, transparency, accountability, and respect for other people.

While we have been attempting to work with Administration directly to resolve problems, we very much appreciate your invitation to communicate with you directly, particularly as some concerns have developed regarding our working relationship with Administration. We, the Classified Staff Council, and I as their representative, welcome this opportunity to address those concerns in an effort to assist you in your duties to monitor and steward.

The framework for tonight's report is a statement found in the District's Strategic Commitments document: "As an employer, Maricopa County Community Colleges embraces an organizational culture committed to supporting, developing and growing its most tangible and valuable asset: the employees who make up its diverse and talented workforce. These strategic commitments will be achieved in a culture of collaboration, conversation, and communication focused on increasing employee diversity/inclusion, satisfaction, growth and performance having a positive impact on both the workplace and our communities."

Unfortunately, we have identified a pattern of behavior that appears to be inconsistent with these Strategic Commitments, and we wish to bring these concerns to your attention in the hope that they may be amicably resolved through a recommitment to the culture of collaboration and mutual respect. We would appreciate your leadership and direction in that regard.

As you are aware, the Classified Staff Council is a relatively new structure, and significant efforts were made to develop that structure, write a constitution and bylaws governing the role and procedures of the Council. These governing documents make clear the elected members of the Council are responsible for presenting the interests of employees in the District's system of shared governance. As such, it is essential that the Council is able to communicate freely and openly with the employees whose interests it is charged with representing.

In some of the upcoming slides, you will see copies of emails that are affecting our ability to abide by our constitution and represent employees. Due to the parameters of power point, they will be hard to read for the audience, however I have provided full size copies of the documents to the Governing Board.

This slide, as mentioned earlier, Governing Board, you can access this on page 8 of your packet, is an email exchange between Kristy Warfield, CSC Communications Officer and Special Projects Assistant to the Vice Chancellor of Human Resources, Megan Tormey. The VCHR has delegated

the oversight of the CSC Officers to her Special Projects Assistant. This exchange is regarding the CSC Officer distribution list, which is one of the primary methods of communication with the CSC Officers regarding the business of the Council. In 2016, when the new Classified Staff Council was formed and the Officers were elected, one task was to create an email distribution list to provide for effective internal communication between, with and among the Officers and constituents. The Special Projects Assistant to the Vice Chancellor of HR created this list, and unbeknownst to us, she had the ability to monitor the communications between and among the officers and constituents. We discovered this in October 2016, when the Special Projects Assistant replied to an email that was sent to the officer distribution list. In the past, with former employee groups, HR was never an owner or manager of email distribution lists, nor in receipt of any emails from said lists. The ability to monitor communications that the Council Officers reasonably believed to be confidential creates distrust, rather than the organizational culture of collaboration, conversation, and communication to which the District aspires. Moreover, although we have requested that the Special Projects Assistant transfer exclusive ownership of the distribution list to the Officers so that she does not have access, she has yet to do so. She has failed to acknowledge our concerns about the chilling effect her access has on effective communication between and among the officers, and has claimed, incorrectly, that her role in administering the list is necessary to maintain continuity.

Similarly, the Special Projects Assistant has attempted to assert control over the discretionary decisions that are provided to the Classified Staff Council, by the Constitution and Bylaws, to the elected Council members. One of my responsibilities under the Classified Staff Council Constitution and Bylaws is to identify individuals to represent Classified Staff perspectives on a variety of District committees. Beginning in December 2016, the Special Projects Assistant to the Vice Chancellor of HR directed me to remove a properly appointed individual from a committee on the grounds that the individual was not an elected member of the Council. The Constitution and Bylaws do not require Classified Staff committee representatives to be elected representatives of the Classified Staff Council; there are many reasons why it might be more effective or efficient for a particular committee to be staffed by someone who is not also serving on the Council. More importantly, the Constitution and Bylaws do not give administration representatives any say in the Classified Staff Council's decisions regarding who to appoint to committees, much less the authority to control those decisions. I therefore declined to rescind the appointment. After more than two months of repeated strong disagreement, the Special Projects Assistant ordered me to remove this duly appointed representative. Although she reconsidered and rescinded that order shortly thereafter, the fact that she spent nearly three months attempting to assert authority she did not possess, going so far as to frame her direction as an order with which I would have to comply or face discipline for insubordination, seriously undermines the relationship of trust and mutual respect that is essential to the shared governance system we have adopted. The Division of Human Resources created this Classified Staff Council to ensure that employee voice was heard and respected, but their behavior has not conveyed a commitment to those principles.

The last matter involves what appears to be tampering with the content and signatures of a written agreement entered into by then current

employee group leaders and the Administration as highlighted by the next several slides. In 2015, employee group leaders entered into a voluntary MOU with Administration to develop a RIF policy for all classified staff. As you can see, in version 1, the signatures of the employee group leaders are dated February 2015. After significant delay, the Vice Chancellor of HR signed the document four months later in June 2015 and added some strikeouts to the negotiated language.

In October 2015, the new employee group leaders requested a clean copy of the MOU be created and signed by the current leaders. This document, shown here as version 2, was created and signed by all parties and the VCHR February 26th 2016. Our understanding was this new agreed to and signed MOU would be uploaded and become a part of the Staff Policy Manual effective upon signature of VCHR as confirmed to in an email to all then current employee group leaders in March 2016.

Recently, a document referred to here as version 3, was discovered online and apparently has been incorporated into the Staff Policy Manual as Appendix F. As you can see, the date is from 2015 and yet some of the language is from the document I identify as version 2, the document signed in 2016. None of the employee group leaders signed the document presented here, yet their signatures and dates, which match those affixed to Version 1 that they signed in 2015, appear with it as though they signed and agreed to Version 3. It appears as though some effort was made to cut and paste signatures from one document to the other, but the language on which the signatures were affixed is not the language that the signers actually reviewed and therefore ratified. When this matter was discovered earlier this month, February 2017, I, as CSC President, asked for an explanation by DOHR, but I have yet to receive one. This is a serious matter, and the lack of explanation or corrective action is very troubling.

All three of these examples raise serious concerns regarding HR's commitment to work productively and respectfully with the Council members who have been charged with providing employee input into the District's system of shared governance. If employees are Maricopa's "most tangible and valuable asset," as this Board's Strategic Plan indicates, then conduct that seeks to monitor and control their representatives, ignores their input, and violates the District's commitments to them, risks devaluing this asset and destroying the culture of collaboration we have worked so hard to build.

I hope what I have shown tonight gives the Governing Board pause and conviction that these actions and behaviors need to be looked into with much greater depth and independence by someone not beholden to the internal administrative power structure. And in the meantime, I ask that you take whatever interim steps you believe necessary and appropriate to make your strategic commitments to protect your employee assets from this mismanagement. Staff morale, engagement, support, and respect are critical to achieve student success.

We, as CSC representatives and Officers, entered into this venture this year with the expressed intention that HR would be our partner and that things would be better than before. We entered this relationship believing in

good faith, and we remain willing to act in good faith – but we need to see that good faith taking place on both sides of this relationship.

ADJUNCT FACULTY
ASSOCIATION

Adjunct Faculty Association President Gail Haase provided the following comments:

Last Saturday, The AFA, along with the Maricopa Center for Learning and Instruction, hosted **L.E.A.D. the Learning and Engagement Adjunct Development Conference** at South Mountain. This was the first time we have been at South and it turned out to be an ideal venue. We would like to thank South for graciously hosting us. It was not easy—they are a very busy place on Saturdays. They also gave us a very generous supply of swag, and there was something for everyone. I think that contributed a great deal to the energized climate of the conference.

For the first time, a past member of the board was our keynote speaker. Doyle Burke brought a well-organized explanation of institutional knowledge to the adjuncts and it was very well received. He explained some of the changes in growth, in funding, and future strategic planning. The adjuncts responded very well to his warm style, and they also asked questions that were really heartfelt, such as how to navigate and do your job well during a period of change and polarization. He talked about shifting demographics and systemic changes. It was gratifying to see how strongly the audience responded to Mr. Burke's presentation.

Because adjuncts are actually only connected by email, we built some social time into the conference. At the close, we hosted a mocktail hour, and had adjuncts sit with their school reps, but with a twist. This time, the tables were arranged in the proposed regions. This turned out very positively as they spontaneously discussed becoming a region. The exchange was intriguing as they talked about their school's respective climate, and speculated as to what it might mean to become a region.

At this conference, the videographers from Mesa's Media Team were there to capture video on the benefits of professional development. They will create a video from this that will be used to promote professional development for adjuncts. Because adjuncts come from so many different disciplines and backgrounds, there are many sets of needs. Programs such as Adjunct Academy or Institute at Gateway and EDGE at Paradise, have paved the way. Now schools, such as Phoenix and South are participating and building similar programs and all have a vision for growing. The Centers for Teaching and Learning (CTL) are kicking off **Spring Training**, which is a major element of on their program called **CTL Near You**, which emphasizes that adjuncts can take any of the professional classes offered at any CTL in the district.

So right now, there are many excellent training opportunities available. There are many more needs to address. Part of the mission of the adjunct district-wide **Faculty Development Team** has been to embrace the challenge of communicating and incentivizing these opportunities.

I would also like to give a shout out to Maricopa Center for Learning and Instruction. This team, especially Stephanie Williams and Don Jensen-Bobadilla, works very hard to help adjuncts, whether with our events or

with **Adjunct Faculty Professional Growth**. The AFA appreciates the support of the district through MCLI.

COMMUNITY LINKAGE
BOARD MEMBERS

19. GOVERNING BOARD REPORTS

Mr. Hendrix was not in attendance.

Mr. Saar indicated that this had been the seventh year he had been able to attend the NLS in D.C., it is now a totally different environment. He spent time with the Department of Labor where he learned about different ways to take advantage of funding from them.

Mrs. Haver commented she had been able to attend the Black History event at PVC where they had enjoyed gospel music and great food.

Dr. Thor reported that it had been an extremely busy month. She visited all ten colleges and noted that each college was unique. All visits were structured differently and each college was blessed with very knowledgeable employees. She also had had briefings by all the division at the District Office. In addition, she presented to a community group at Sun City Grand. She attended the Asian Lunar Year banquet sponsored by the Asian Pacific Employee Group. Early in the month she attend the National Legislative summit in Washington D.C. where they were able to meet with members of the congressional delegation and were able to advocate for the importance of Pell Grants and DACA students.

Mrs. McGrath also attended PVC’s Black History event and very much enjoyed it.

Mr. Gutierrez commented he had also attended the Asian Pacific and PVC events. In addition, he also attended a MakerSpace Presentation and found it very compelling.

Mrs. Livingston had an opportunity to be at CPAC in DC the week following the ACCT NLS conference.

EXTERNAL COMMUNITY

20. External Community Reports

AADGB

Mr. Gutierrez announced he was the new representative for AADGB and would be attending the next board meeting on March 9.

ASBA

There was no report for ASBA.

ACCT

Mr. Saar reported that four board members travelled to Washington, D.C. in February for the ACCT National Legislative Summit and would be attending the national conference in September.

NEXT BOARD MEETINGS

21-27. Establishment of Next Meeting Dates, Times and Places
President Gutierrez announced the following future meetings.
March 14, 2017, 4:00 p.m., Policy Committee, GB Room
March 14, 2017, 5:00 p.m., Agenda Review, GB Room
March 14, 2017, 6:00 p.m., Executive or Work Session, GB Room
March 28, 2017, 5:00 p.m., Budget & Finance Committee, GB Rm
March 28, 2017, 6:30 p.m., Regular Board Meeting, GB Room

March 28, 2017, 6:30 p.m., Executive Session and Special Board Meeting

ADJOURNMENT

President Gutierrez adjourned the regular board meeting at 8:20 p.m. and board members proceeded to go into Executive Session.

Dr. Linda M. Thor
Governing Board Secretary