



Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board Minutes April 8, 2017

A Special Meeting to hear College and Capital Development Budget Presentations of the Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board was scheduled to be held beginning at 8:30 a.m. at the Rio Conference Center, 2323 West 14th Street, Tempe, Arizona, pursuant to ARS §38-431.07, notice having been duly given.

GOVERNING BOARD

Alfredo Gutierrez, President
Linda Thor, Secretary
Johanna Haver, Member
Jean McGrath, Member
Dana Saar, Member
Laurin Hendrix, Member
Tracy Livingston, Member

ADMINISTRATION

Maria Harper-Marinick
LaCoya Shelton
Gaye Murphy
Paul Dale for PVC
Edward Kelty
Christina Schultz
Chris Bustamante
Bill Guerriero
Steven Gonzales
Jan Gehler
Chris Haines
Terry Leyba-Ruiz
Ernie Lara
Shari Olson
Sasan Poureetezadi
Becki Currey, Legal

CALL TO ORDER OF SPECIAL MEETING

Board President Alfredo Gutierrez welcomed everyone in attendance to a session intended to hear presentations from the colleges and the District Office on challenges and needs being faced. He stated we are one of the premier community college systems in the country and one of the most highly regarded but it is also very clear we are not making the kind of progress we need to make. It is clear that enrollment is going down, perilously so in some cases, and the first victims of declining enrollment are going to be the faculty. We are that close and we all know it. Enrollment and persistence – there has to be a way that we deal with it. We all understand our challenges, our financial challenges, and this will require creativity to resolve. Some of the Board recently went to San Antonio to visit Alamo Community College whose metrics are like ours. Their enrollment rate, as well as certificates and degrees, however, ours are dropping. We are here on a mission different from a regular board meetings. We recognize that the magic happens at the colleges and we are here to listen to what the colleges need. Keep in mind that the magic needs to happen at the District also. The advisor ratio is very low. We have to make a commitment and the District needs to commit funding. It is not our intent to choose winners and losers but to hear creativity. There has been the discussion of a 2% increase in taxation but we are only going to increase this if you can incite us about what plans are in place. The challenge is to persuade the Governing Board to do that.

Budget and Finance Committee Chair Dr. Linda Thor came forward next and commented that she agreed with all that President Gutierrez had to say. She expressed appreciation to the colleges for responding to this Board request for proposals. She stated that the Governing Board has a calendar for putting in place a tax increase. A 2% tax increase would result in \$9 million extra in funding but before the Board considers a property tax increase the Board needs to better understand the colleges' needs. There is a 2.4% increase in student success initiatives. It is not the intent of the Board to prioritize projects but the question before the Board is whether the requests are convincing enough to consider a property tax increase.

Presentations would be limited to twenty minutes, including time for questions, and colleges would present in alpha order.

Chandler-Gilbert Community College

Chandler-Gilbert Community College – Dr. Bill Guerriero

- CGCC is well-positioned to help its communities to reach their higher education attainment and economic development goals
- Residential development is in full swing – focus on multi-family
- Commercial building expansion and billions invested by major tech firms

Dr. Guerriero provided graphics showing projected growth in CGCC's service area. The numbers included changes in Arizona public and private High School Graduates from 2016 to 2032, and also the projected changes in age groups for 2016-2021. He also provided the projected growth in population and jobs for Gilbert, Chandler, and the Town of Queen Creek. The service area includes jobs in unmanned aeronautic systems and light industrial technology which includes additive manufacturing, prototyping and non-destructive testing.

In order to keep pace with demand, CGCC needs to focus on advising and career services, recruitment and early outreach, curriculum and pathways, as well as faculty staffing. Their budget proposal summary includes the following:

Unmanned Aerial Systems program: \$200,000
 Light Industrial Technology Program: \$200,000
 Student Services Support: \$855,500
 Residential Faculty: \$180,000

Dr. Guerriero concluded by stating that CGCC's capacity to meet community needs will benefit MCCC.

CGCC Fall Headcount at Pecos is 10-12,000 and at Williams 2,700. They have been able to maintain enrollment due to dual enrollment which masks core enrollment. They have been level in traditional enrollment for the last five years. CGCC no longer contracts with ASU East to teach 100 and 200 level courses. A marketing opportunity exists to reach out to students regarding tuition difference for same classes they take at ASU East or Main.

Estrella Mountain Community College

Estrella Mountain Community College – Dr. Ernie Lara

Dr. Lara opened by stating that EMC is a growing college with a conviction to Access, Persistence, and Completion. Their college started out in 1990 with enrollment of 780 and as of 2016 the enrollment is 9,344. FTSE has grown from 2,645 in 2006/07 to 4,739 in 2016/17.

Number of Degrees and Certificates are Increasing

| EMCC Degrees & Certificates | 2011-2012 | 2012-2013 | 2013-2014 | 2014-2015 | 2015-2016 | change 14-15 vs 15-16 | 3 year increase |
|---------------------------------------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|-----------------------|-----------------|
| Duplicated Awards - All Awards | 1,173 | 1,475 | 1,778 | 2,186 | 2,334 | 8% | 58% |
| Unduplicated Headcount - All Awards | 585 | 739 | 836 | 966 | 1,081 | 12% | 46% |
| Duplicated Occupational Awards CCLAAS | 281 | 387 | 541 | 659 | 666 | 1% | 72% |
| Unduplicated Headcount CCLAAS | 176 | 267 | 308 | 333 | 361 | 8% | 35% |

The college level course success rate has increased from 75% in 2011 to 82% in 2015; the retention rate has increased from 58% to 64% from 2011 to 2015; and six-year graduation rate has gone from 20% to 21% since 2012. The success rate in developmental education courses has gone from 73% in 2011 to 77% as of 2015. Math and English success rates have also increased. EMCC is a growing college seeking to increase the degree and certificate completion rates of first-time, full-time students from 17% - 25% within five years. Additional full-time faculty are essential to building sustainable pathways in general education, transfer education and workforce development for EMCC students and the West Valley community.

EMCC has the highest need of residential faculty in the district. The ideal percentage of residential to adjunct faculty teaching load is 60/40.

- EMCC current ratio - 36% (residential faculty) to 64% (adjunct faculty)
- EMCC needs 72 additional faculty to attain compliance with 60/40

EMCC has the 5th highest FTSE in the MCCCC (Audited FY 2014-2015), but second lowest number of faculty (FY 2016-2017).

EMC’s total Academic Affairs Request is for 7 FTE at a total budget request of \$565,005. For Student Affairs the request is for 5 FTE at a total cost of \$304,875, and Administrative Services 4 FTE for a cost of \$261,503. Total request is for \$1,157,698.

GateWay Community College

GateWay Community College – Dr. Steven Gonzales

GWC is a “Student-Ready” college which means they provide high-touch experiences and proactive processes that facilitate student learning, development, support and success. Historically, 2000 new students start GWC each Fall. The completion rate is 80% and the percentage of the Fall Cohort remaining on Spring 45th Day is 53%. They have a three-phase approach: Get ‘Em, Keep ‘Em, and Complete ‘Em. The three phases include:

- Get ‘Em
 - Advisors
 - Testing Center Staff
 - Student Service Coordinator and Specialist to support Summer Bridge programs
 - ESL Coordinator

- Keep ‘Em
 - Student Success Coaches
 - Learning Associates & Tutors
 - Counseling Faculty
 - Student Service Specialist to support Disability Resource Services (DRS)
 - Peer mentors
 - Service Learning & Civic Engagement Coordinator
- Complete ‘EM
 - Residential Faculty for high demand program
 - Career Services Navigators

Their Return on Investment is 250 FTSE and over \$640,000 per year infused revenues when keeping 50%. The return is 186 FTSE and over \$480,000 per year infused revenues when bringing back 50%. 700 students lost financial aid due to academic performance and didn't return.

Areas by Program:

- GW Summer Bridge Program Support Proactive and Ongoing Advisement First Year Experience
- Testing Center Support
- Supplemental Instruction Support
- Institutional Research, Planning and Effectiveness Support
- Student and Learning Support
- Targeted Program Expansion

FTSE is 2,900 and Headcount is 10-12,000. Ratio of advisors is on low side at one for 700-800 students.

Glendale Community College

Glendale Community College – Dr. Terri Leyba-Ruiz

Dr. Ruiz focused on strategic commitments #1 and #3. She commented that the requests from GCC were ten fulltime faculty positions at a cost of \$1,000,000; two academic advisors for new to college students at a cost of \$178,000; academic support services at a cost of \$183,000; and resource development for grant writing support to increase external funding at approximately \$3 million in three years.

FTSE at GCC is 10,000.

Mesa Community College

Mesa Community College – Dr. Sasan Poureetezadi

President Poureetezadi provided an overview of Mesa Community College which included the Vision, Mission, and Values, as well as number of campuses/sites, programs degrees and certificates, enrollment, and strategic commitments. The funding request for MCC totaled \$3,240,000. This request included the following initiatives:

- Guided Pathways for Success \$1,400,000
- College Advisor Program Expansion Tempe 600,000
- Information Technology Institute 1,000,000
- Hispanic Serving Institute On-Boarding 140,000
- Recruiting Campaign with Blackboard Cell Center 100,000

Details for the Guided Pathways to Success

- MCC will employ the GPS model to help students identify their goals and needs, and chart clear routes to timely completion

- Students progress through carefully sequenced courses with recognizable academic milestones and integrated support services
- Integrated support services
- June 2015 initiative launched
- June 2018 GPS development
- Hire Dedicated Full-time staff
- Define Program of Study
- Define Integrated Support Services
- December 2018 E-Tool Launch
- Funding needs
- Start-up \$600,000
- Annual On-going \$800,000

Details on New “College Advisor” Program

- Partnership with MPS
- Increase MPS enrollment from 25% to 38%
- Goal increase FTSE 425
- “College Advisors” imbedded in high schools
- Full service
- Dedicated 7 person team
- College Funding \$730,000

Details on Expand “Outreach” Program

- Form Partnership with Tempe Public Schools
- Increase enrollment from 15% to 28%
- Goal increase FTSE 375
- Six Advisors & Recruiters
- Provide Full Service

Details on Information Technology Institute

- Formation of East Valley Technology Corridor
- Super Demand
 - 9,700 average 3-year openings
 - Average salary \$67,000
 - Future growth 25%+
- Source: Office of Maricopa Workforce Development
- Seeking Competencies
 - 6,500 Open Arizona Jobs
 - 3,100 Entry Level
 - 3,600 above \$60,000
- Create an “Institute”
- Build on strong existing IT program
- Expand Programs in High Demand
- Develop & Launch New Certificate Programs
- Create Long-term Business Plan

Details on Hispanic Serving Institute On-Boarding

- The Hispanic-Serving Institutions (HSI) mission is to assist with strengthening institutional programs, facilities, and services to expand the educational opportunities for Hispanic Americans and other underrepresented populations.
- Fall 2016 45th Day student body comprised of 25% Hispanic students and 41% minority students.
- City of Mesa 28% Hispanic
- Next Step On-Boarding Students for Completion

Details on Recruiting Campaign w/Blackboard Call Center

- Fall 2016 Success
 - Cost \$50,000

- FTSE Increase 574
- Spring 2017 Success
 - Cost \$50,000
 - FTSE Increase 962
- ROI = \$630,000+
- Double weeks of campaign

Paradise Valley Community College

Paradise Valley Community College – Dr. Paul Dale

President Dale spoke about the PVC Puma Pathway emphasis which stressed student access and success. It includes the following components for students: Prepare, Engage, Commit, Complete, and Thrive. Dr. Dale provides success rates in college-level success, development courses, Fall-to-Fall Retention Rates, as well as the 37% increase in awards since 2010 which have gone from 1345 to 1848.

The PVCC Budget Request Overview includes the following:

Priority 1: Puma Pathway – Prepare and Engage

- Enhance Support for Student Services
- \$454,000

Priority 2: Puma Pathway – Engage, Commit, and Complete

- Develop Integrated Public Health Workforce Program
- \$210,000

Priority 3: Puma Pathway – Engage and Complete

- Expand Academic Support Services
- \$417,000

FTSE: 4,600

Phoenix College

Phoenix College – Chris Haines

President Haines introduced her presentation by pointing out headcount numbers since 2013 which have declined from 12,676 to 11,508. 77% of students at Phoenix College place in developmental education, 54% are Hispanic, 22% are first generation, and 55% are Pell-granted students. Phoenix College has four priorities aligned with their commitments:

FTSE: 11,580

1. 60:40 - To build a thriving community through access and student success;
2. Grants - To be a driving force for economic and workforce development;
3. Technology - To build a thriving community through access and student success;
4. Civic Engagement - To be a driving force for economic and workforce development.

60:40 Faculty Load

Studies support that student success is elevated by access to full-time faculty.

- Improve & increase student-faculty contact
- 10 additional faculty positions needed to make significant progress \$100,000 X 10 FTE - \$1,000,000 Increase Resident to 49%

Grants Writer

PC is committed to finding grant opportunities that benefit students, the community, and the workforce.

- Grant funding has become increasingly important as state funding has diminished.
- Funding supports:
 - Student success programming
 - STEM/ STEAM research & pipeline development
 - Student scholarships
 - \$69,572

Technology Resources for Students

Having current technology in classrooms, labs, the library and self-help areas directly impacts access, instruction and student success.

- Funding would support
 - Expanded & improved WiFi - Bring Your Own Device (BYOD)
 - Maintenance & upgrades to instructor stations
 - Server management for self-paced online courses
 - Instructional software
 - \$400,000

Civic Engagement Service Learning

PC should be the service-learning model for the District

- Develop workforce skills in partnership with community organizations
- Increases student civic engagement in community affairs, retention & graduation
- \$162,578

Rio Salado College

Total Costs: \$1,632,150

Rio Salado College – Dr. Chris Bustamante

President Bustamante stated that Rio Salado College was nationally one of the most innovative institutions across the country. They boasted 55,000 students and FTSE of 12,682. Their budget request totals \$1,638,377 for the following:

- Advisors, Admin and Reg Staff \$854,394
- Counselors & Support Staff \$209,512
- On-line course accessibility \$322,572
- Compliance coordinator \$70,633
- Student access and success initiatives \$141,266
- Disability services \$40,000

Scottsdale Community College

Scottsdale Community College – Dr. Jan Gehler

President Gehler outlined the requests from Scottsdale Community College which included:

- Identification of those needs that emanate from Administrative Services and,
- Identification of those that traditionally relate directly to Student Success.

Their request represents their needs as they close out almost 9 years of personnel reductions, going from 447 employees to 402, that were made to help meet budget reductions. Facing budget reductions beginning in 2008 they made a purposeful decision to 'hold instruction harmless.' Over that period they added 8 faculty (from 160 in 2008, to 168 in 2017). As a footnote, a consequence of this decision was that SCC has been at 60/40 (Permanent to Part Time Faculty) for a number of years.

At SCC they need to Support Student Success through Front Door and Retention direct services, including:

- Advising with aim to reduce advisor/student ratios, as discussed during budget work session
 - Learning Center Technicians in high need areas, e.g. science/math, DevEd
 - Audio Visual Technicians critical to Film School student success; this request substitutes general fund for *currently course fee-funded* technicians
 - Compliance-related services, including:
 - Veteran's Services
 - Admissions and Records (compliance related reports)
 - Disability Resource and Services
 - ADA accommodations for Online instruction
- For some, not all, of the positions we need, they will require support costs for space, furniture, technology, etc.
- Business Services mandated services, including:
 - Electrician to support safe and cost effective operation of our 162-acre campus and 23 buildings.
 - Budget/Data Analyst to translate data into meaningful and accurate information for administrator and manager decision-making.
 - IT Security to manage security, change control of network and enterprise software systems at college
 - Programmer/Database Analyst to support dynamic environment for instruction and business processes

Final word about their business environment that has led to these requests:

- Expenses have risen for utilities, compliance, personnel [hiring in at higher steps in order to secure a desired candidate]
- Accumulative effect of FTSE Giveback and covering college share of State fund reduction: just over \$5M over past 8 years.
- Budget philosophy of SCC, from inception, practice has been to fully allocate. In all budget reductions hold instruction harmless. We are now eliminating faculty lines to achieve budget reduction targets.

FTSE: 5,200 Advisor Ratio 1/1300

South Mountain Community College

South Mountain Community College – Dr. Shari Olson

SMC is very diverse. 70% dev ed and first semester; 228 students graduated and 500 are expected to graduate this year.

Request #1: **Population Outreach - \$225,000**

- Every year, 800 at-risk, underserved teens age out of the foster care system.
- Create a Coordinator of Special Populations/Opportunity Youth – “Success Coach”
- Provide scholarships or tuition waivers for 60 foster students in year one.

This initiative supports efforts to increase access to a population that is not likely to enroll in college on their own and is currently underserved.

Request #2: **Native American Outreach- \$75,000**

- Gila River and Pasqua Yaqui populations are close to South Mountain.

- The College has a specially-funded Native American Outreach Coordinator but unstable grant funding may hinder the continuation of this outreach opportunity.

OUTCOMES:

Increase the Native American enrollment from 5% to 10%

Become an Native American-serving Nontribal Institution (NASNTI) [Grant Opportunities]

Request #3: Permanent Funding for Tutoring –\$60,000

- 70% of our students test into at least one developmental education course.
- Tutoring is currently funded through course fees.

Students will be able to obtain tutoring in all subjects that are offered at the college and will no longer have to pay course fees to secure these necessary services.

Request #4: Improve Student to Advisor Ratio - \$210,000 (three advisors)

- One of the difficulties that students report on completing their degree is their inability to see an advisor.
- By improving the ratio of students to advisor, students have the opportunity to develop their academic plan, their course schedule, and connect them to their future goals.

Additional advisor interactions will enhance a success-coaching relationship, improving persistence through an Intrusive, Proactive Advisor model. In this new model, advisors would be able to anticipate student challenges, monitor student grades and attendance while keeping in close contact with faculty about student progress.

Request #5: Increase Under-represented Student Populations in STEM Careers - \$60,000

- SMCC is partnering with Base 11 (non-profit) to increase graduation rates in STEM careers.
- The college will be opening a state-of-the-art fabrication lab in the Fall but does not currently have the Fund 1 budget to fund a permanent lab technician

The advanced fabrication lab will be staffed and maintained by a qualified technician who can assist students with completing projects and providing students with workforce-ready skills. This lab will support all academic programs of the college, in particular the engineering, math, science and entrepreneurship programs.

Request #6: Improve 60:40 ratio - \$100,000

- SMCC continues to strive toward the goal that our classes are taught by qualified, diverse, dedicated faculty.
- Chemistry faculty, in particular, are perpetually in overload status.

Our Chemistry faculty would be able to return to a more reasonable load while at the same time, allowing more students to be taught by full-time faculty. SMCC's current faculty load to adjunct load ratio is 47:53.

Capital Development – Arlen Solochek**Capital Development**

Mr. Solochek commented that he was in attendance to present requests for money to maintain the system. After twenty-five years, the capital kitty is empty.

Capital Needs for FY17-18 are included in the proposed budget, however, they do not include IT issues. They do, however, include capital needs for

instruction (\$21,708,809), facility and non-instructional (\$82,878.897), college technology (\$37,115,803), and lastly for districtwide programs \$36,602,800).

Major Categories – Facilities Include:

- Facility and Non-Instructional Related Needs
 - Large(r) Remodeling/ Renovation/ Construction projects
 - Building and Site improvements/ repairs/ replacement/ maintenance
 - Non-instructional furniture and equipment
 - Fleet and Vehicle Purchases
 - Athletic Facilities
 - College Safety and Security Improvements
 - M&O and other general equipment purchase/ repairs/ replacements

- College Technology Related Needs
 - Classroom and Lab Instructional Technology, including computers and audio/visual systems
 - Non-Instructional/Supporting Technology, including voice and computers
 - General Building data/voice/audio-visual system equipment, cabling and other general backbone/support needs

- District-wide Programs
 - Annual Fund 7 Major Maintenance Funding
 - Annual Fund 7 Emergency Maintenance Funding
 - *continue* Bond Roofing Maintenance
 - *continue* Bond Paving Maintenance
 - *continue* Bond Athletic Facility Maintenance
 - *continue* Bond Central Plant Major Equipment Replacement
 - *continue* Bond Energy and Water Conservation
 - *continue* Bond Hazardous Materials Abatement
 - *continue* Bond ADA and other Regulatory Requirements
 - *continue* Bond College Safety and Security

Mr. Solochek explained that they are doing creative financing now. They had used bond funds before. They are in the hole on maintenance.

Board Comments:

Board Comments

College presentations were very informative. It is evident that colleges have done their research and are keeping up with national trends and best practices. The purpose for today's special meeting was to inform the Board of the needs of the colleges and give direction to staff of 2% tax increase. The Board is not making any decision today.

Chancellor Comments:

Chancellor Comments

In synthesizing what she heard today in terms of themes, the Chancellor stated she heard two large categories: Strategic and Operational. There is a need to look at Persistence and Pathways as a system. Individual efforts should be approached more systematically. In the area of advising, a different model should be explored and a system model should be looked at. We talk about advising every year but a decision needs to be made.

High school partnerships should include recruitment and marketing and should look at what is unique to each college. In areas that are being served by multiple colleges, coordination should take place so that not all go in to recruit at one school. Have a systemic approach.

The Task Force Work was completed this week and the recommendations will be received in a couple of weeks. We will be receiving reports around workforce development, institutes, academies, and CTE models of how we serve our students and the public. Three colleges referred to the one-on-one corridor. We did not hear about working together. The Task Force will make recommendations on allocations. What we are doing in the meantime is using \$2.4 Million as a result of cuts. We also have some unused Prop 301 resources to be used in the manner intended. For 60-40 we have a \$1 million the budget proposal equivalent to ten positions. For Capital we have a plan but it is not clear what it will be used for. We will engage with the board on the recommendations of the Task Force in a special meeting. This was a good meeting with the Board and all the honesty expressed. It was good that everyone was thoughtful and connected to strategic planning. Good to hear about the work of the colleges and we hope that it was a reflective process.

Dr. Thor expressed that she agreed that we needed to have a meeting about the priorities in the strategic plan but also to talk about how we might generate funds, and whether we want to plan for a GO Bond Campaign in 2020. Do we have any funds to maintain buildings? Need to know immediate needs. The Board will meet on April 11 for an agenda review of the April 25 Board Meeting to discuss what a budget will look like without a 2% levy or for a larger increase permitted under the constitution. A higher increase would necessitate more information. If the Board approves a budget with a tax increase, we would move forward to publish in the newspaper about a tax increase. At the April 25 meeting if you vote a tax increase, there would be a public hearing on May 23.

President Gutierrez commented it was clear what the decision points were. Everyone has to think through a preliminary decision on whether to proceed or not to proceed. Decision will be made on April 25.

Mr. Saar commented that the Board should be very targeted on any new funds that are put into the system. Mrs. McGrath stated it is hard to justify a tax increase when enrollment is dropping. Mrs. Livingston indicated this won't sit well in some districts. Need to talk to each other about what can we do without.

President Gutierrez stated what was heard today was terrific, however, something that did not happen was "no big goal", no Wildly Important Goal. Thinking about a big hairy audacious goal. Not for small increments. Without it, let's just pretend everything is fine. There is a problem in the system and we have to fix it.

Mrs. Haver stated WIG works. At Alamo they had three basic goals. It is important to become one District without these differences. At Alamo they had five colleges all doing things five different directions. They started out with one important goal. The report from the Task Force will be given soon. A special meeting to hear the report will be scheduled on May 9.

The Special Session adjourned at 2:00 p.m.

Adjournment

Dr. Linda M. Thor
Governing Board Secretary