



**Maricopa County Community College District
Governing Board Minutes
August 9, 2016**

A Policy Committee Meeting and Agenda Review of the Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board were scheduled to be held beginning at 3:00 p.m. at the District Support Services Center, 2411 West 14th Street, Tempe, Arizona, pursuant to ARS §38-431.07, notice having been duly given.

GOVERNING BOARD

Alfredo Gutierrez, President
Johanna Haver, Secretary
(via teleconferencing)
Doyle Burke, Member
John Heep, Member
Dana Saar, Member
Jean McGrath, Member

Absent:

Tracy Livingston, Member

ADMINISTRATION

Maria Harper-Marinick
Paul Dale
LaCoya Shelton-Johnson
Gaye Murphy
Gene Giovannini
Edward Kelty
Steven Gonzales
Terry Leyba Ruiz
Ernie Lara
Christina Schultz
Todd Simmons for Chris Bustamante
Bill Guerriero
Brianna Bendotti for MCOR
Maggie McConnell

**CALL TO ORDER
OF POLICY
COMMITTEE**

Policy Committee Chair Dana Saar called to order the Policy Committee Meeting for August 9, 2016. Mr. Saar commented that the agenda called for moving forward on Board Outcomes and Metrics for Workforce Development Policy 1.2. The recommended outcomes on the current items were different from the First Read in that the last two outcomes were removed as they were deemed to be operational. The removed outcomes addressed equipment to meet industry standards and faculty certification.

**POLICY
LANGUAGE
PRESENTATION/
OUTCOME
STATEMENTS/
METRICS**

Executive Vice Chancellor and Provost Dr. Paul Dale reviewed the Proposed Workforce Development Outcome Statements and Metrics listed as follows. Some of the Metrics are existing and some are new.

Board Outcome Statement	Draft Metrics
A. Students who successfully complete a workforce program will be competitive in seeking sustainable employment compatible with their industry credentials.	# of certificate and associate degree programs related to the highest demand occupations can get from Economic Modeling Specialists International (EMSI)
	# of certificate and associate degree programs related to the fastest growing (emerging) occupations
	# of vocational training and sub-certificates (to align with statewide Achieve60Az attainment goal which includes workforce credentials – CISCO, specialized certificates, etc.)
	Percent of graduates employed in a field related to their certificate or degree (e.g., 1 year after graduating)
	Changes in wages (e.g., 1 year prior to enrolling in program vs 1 year after completing)
	Return on Investment (ROI) metric related to corporate training: Number of student participating in internships and/or apprenticeships compared to costs

B. Students will gain employable skills within a reasonable time and expense.	Awards conferred in Custom Training and Education (CTE)/occupational programs (count and/or ratio per 1,000 FTSE for example)
	Graduation Rate (Degree/Certificate Completion) of Occupational Student Cohort within 3 and 6 years
	Custom Training and Education (CTE) course success rates of students engaged in alternative courses: online, hybrid, and accelerated classes of eight weeks or less (excluding high school dual enrollment)
	Debt to earnings ratio from Gainful Employment (GE) reporting
	Number of students enrolled in accelerated/competency paced relevant Custom Training and Education (CTE) program offerings
	Percent of students who completed the program on time (matching to Gainful Employment (GE) Disclosure data)
C. Business and industry employment/workforce needs will be met in a responsive and effective time period.	# new workforce development programs and data points of time from "early alert" to implementation
	Number of students enrolled in accelerated/competency based/self-paced relevant Custom Training and Education (CTE) program offerings
D. District actions, using industry guidance to meet workforce needs, will yield positive responses from Advisory Committees.	Results of advisory committee surveys indicate support for District actions
E. Students enrolled in secondary Custom Training and Education (CTE) programs will articulate effectively into MCCCCD programs of similar curriculum.	# of high school Joint Technical Education Districts (JTED) Custom Training and Education CTE transfers to MCCCCD programs
	# Associate in Applied Science (AAS) to Bachelor of Applied Science (BAS) students (two plus two programs)
	# of students receiving Certificates of Completion (CCL) through competency based evaluation
F. MCCCCD workforce initiatives will positively enhance growth in Arizona's Gross Domestic Product (GDP).	F. MCCCCD workforce initiatives will positively enhance growth in Arizona's Gross Domestic Product (GDP).

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

- Discussion of the foregoing metrics suggested that the term Custom Training and Education (CTE) be changed to Career Training and Education.
- These should be measurement goals as opposed to achievement goals. A goal is needed to increase performance.
- There is a need for reasonable goals that are an improvement over what we are doing.
- There are no targets now but we could get targets comparing data to Baseline.
- A Baseline is needed in order to discuss reasonable goals.
- We need to measure where we are and what can reasonably be obtained over the next five years.
- We need a reasonable goal. Staff needs to determine what is a reasonable goal.
- The workforce is changing continually and we are trying to meet needs with resources that we might not have. Our future may be strained and we may not be able to achieve.
- We are taking into account what the needs of the state are and look at industries that are growing in the Valley. Tonight we are only addressing policy but we will take into account what is changing. We will not set goals that are not achievable within the organization.

- There should be more information available by the end of the semester pertaining to the Maricopa Priorities Project with CTE.
- Two board members expressed concern with the metrics and moving forward without a program that has specific goals. We need to have Administration come back with comprehensive plan. Another board member stressed these were metrics only and have yet to establish a specific outcome.
- Metrics need to be related to goals. The Chancellor and Provost need to come back with comprehensive plan.
- The Chancellor commented that the metrics will be looked at more clearly to identify and establish the Baseline and would be more feasible. Metrics are illustrative. Targets that are reasonable need to be established.
- A constant complaint from the business community is the organizational structure which does not lend itself to quick decisions. The structure is bureaucratically top heavy. We are a “super tanker” not a “jet ski.” We need a speedy process.
- We need to have an outcome for Advisory Committees and be able to measure effectiveness in real time. There is a need for consolidating resources.
- We need to do a better job in the effectiveness between high schools, colleges and JTEDs. We need to make sure that credits transfer between JTEDs, two-year to four-year, and high school partners.
- We need to review the term “competency-based” although it was pointed out that this is a buzz word in education.

NEXT STEPS

The Board was directed to look at the handout containing the following language on Board Policy 1.3 dealing with Development Education. (Note: Part D was asked to be removed as it pertained to Civic Engagement.)

The Maricopa Community Colleges
Governing Board Outcomes

**BOARD POLICY
1.3 –
DEVELOPMENTAL
EDUCATION**

1.3 Developmental Education

- A. Students will develop the competencies necessary to be successful in college level work.
 - Success rate in college-level math after completion of developmental math
 - Success rate in college-level English after completion of developmental English
 - Success rate in college-level courses after completion of developmental reading
- B. Academic achievement gaps based on race, ethnicity, and income will be reduced.
 - The variability of performance for each demographic variable (gender, ethnicity, and Pell grant status) will be measured for developmental level course completion and subsequent success in college level courses
- C. Students will benefit from enhanced educational delivery options.
 - Percent of developmental students engaged in non-traditional courses: online, hybrid, and accelerated classes of eight weeks or less (excluding high school dual enrollment)
 - Selected items from the following national surveys: CCSSE, Noel-Levitz Student Satisfaction Inventory, and the ECAR Students and Information Technology in Higher Education Survey
- ~~D. Students will develop the competencies to analyze and participate in democratic processes through community, civic, and global learning activities.~~
 - ~~○ CCSSE results compared to the national mean for the following items:~~
 - ~~— How much has college experience contributed to knowledge, skills, and development in contributing to welfare of the community~~
 - ~~— How important to volunteer in a community service project~~
 - ~~— How often have serious conversations with diverse students~~
 - ~~• The number of students participating in study abroad programs~~

- ~~Participation in service learning opportunities~~
- ~~The number of students registered~~

AMENDED April 28, 2015, Motion No. 10292

ADOPTED May 24, 2011, Motion No. 9814

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

- With this Outcome we are meeting the needs of the public we serve. We need to have a policy that makes sense. There needs to be a distinction between the students that come to us and when they completed high school, whether it was recently or many years ago. According to literature, residential faculty are much more successful with developmental education. If this is true, we should have a metric to increase residential faculty. We should have a discussion or presentation of metrics and what we should be using. There are programs of great hope that provide direction that should be expanded on. It should be a priority for the new Administration to improve developmental education.
- There should be a partnership between us and K-12. We should triage to determine “how they come to where you are and how they can get to where they want.”
- It was asked if there were syllabus/syllabi for adjuncts and residential faculty. It was explained that there were competencies for each course and clear metrics. Training is provided for adjuncts so they could be more effective in developmental education courses. They are committed to ways to improve.
- It was recommended that someone make a presentation on metrics that provide highlights, developmental education reform and math modules.

CONCLUDING COMMENTS

Mr. Saar called attention to the ACCT GISS Institute to be held September 8 where much of the aforementioned will be discussed.

ADJOURNMENT TO AGENDA REVIEW

The Policy Committee Meeting adjourned at 4:02 P.M. The Agenda Review was called to order at 4:38 p.m.

AGENDA REVIEW

The agenda for the June 28, 2016 Regular Board Meeting was reviewed and discussed. The following items were discussed in greater detail:

13.4 GWCC and Johnson Controls, Inc. Lease. – It was explained that it took longer than usual to negotiate the lease (July 1, 2015 – June 30, 2017), however we have a long-standing relationship with Johnson Controls, a nationwide company that is highly regarded. Board Members were invited to visit the facility at GateWay Community College.

15.2 Proposed Changes: Governing Board Policy 1.2 Workforce and Economic Development – It was questioned if this item would be revised and the response was made that only the metrics will be changed. It is Outcomes that we are concerned with, not metrics. The Completion Agenda was adopted about six years ago and it is the outcomes on metrics that we have targeted. The part that will come to the Board is on the left hand side of the chart. There is a need to revisit the left hand side and tie those to the metrics. A Resolution could be brought to the Board. The Board has dictated the metrics to the Chancellor in the past. In November we get a report on goals that were set. Metrics need to measure goals.

16.3 Job Order Contracting Purchase Order for Veteran Services Building Expansion and Remodel at Glendale Community College – Because of the delay with completing the Veteran Services Building, there was a job order contracting purchase order being requested. This project was originally to be completed along with the T-2 Building but had to be worked on separately. If the two had been together, the costs of the project would have been adhered to. According to Arlen Solocheck, the T-2 Building came in under budget so that savings is offsetting the costs of Veteran Services Building project.

**ADJOURNMENT
TO EXECUTIVE
SESSION**

The Agenda Review adjourned at 5:15 p.m. and Board Members moved to the Maricopa Room for an Executive Session.

President Alfredo Gutierrez for
Johanna Haver,
Governing Board Secretary