



Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board Minutes October 22, 2013

An executive session and regular meeting of the Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board were scheduled to be held beginning at 5:30 p.m. at the District Support Services Center, 2411 West 14th Street, Tempe, Arizona, pursuant to A.R.S. Section 38-431.02, notice having been duly given.

GOVERNING BOARD

- Doyle Burke, President
- Dana Saar, Secretary
- Randolph Lumm, Member
- Ben Miranda, Member
- Debra Pearson, Member

ADMINISTRATION

Rufus Glasper
Maria Harper-Marinick
Debra Thompson
James Bowers
Steve Helfgot
Lee Combs
Linda Lujan
Ernie Lara
Steven Gonzales
Irene Kovala
Shouan Pan
Paul Dale
Anna Solley
Chris Bustamante
Jan Gehler
Shari Olson
Susie Pulido for Gene Giovannini

OPENING AND EXECUTIVE SESSION

The regular board meeting was called to order at 5:30 p.m. and President Burke welcomed everyone to the meeting.

MOTION

Motion 10109

Board Member Burke made a motion to go into Executive Session. Board Member Saar seconded. Motion approved 5-0. President Burke reported the general session would reconvene in the Governing Board Room after Executive Session at approximately 6:30 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER

The regular board meeting was re-called to order at 6:43 p.m.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The assembly pledged allegiance to the United States of America led by Governing Board Member Randolph Lumm.

CLASS ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

President Burke welcomed Dr. Maria Hesse's HED634 class from ASU.

SUBSTITUTIONS

There was one substitution for a member of the CEC.

STUDENT LIFE REPORTS

Student Government representatives from Glendale Community College spoke next.

- Ms. Wendy Resparto—President
- Mr. Anthony "Buddie" Lee—Vice President
- Ms. Paulene Garcia—Treasurer
- Ms. Becky Velez—Secretary
- Mr. Ricaro "Rico" Moran—Public Relations

Ms. Resparto began by thanking the Board for the opportunity to present. She said GCC hosts many diverse events including Civility Week which aids in development and awareness of a civil society. There were 20 in-person sessions addressing the topic presenting during the week. She then introduced Mr. Lee to speak and mentioned they had brought their blue bracelets for civility and shared them outside for anyone who is interested. Mr. Lee said GCC is looking at becoming more

sustainable. Student Government purchased Igloo water bottles and set up refill stations in high traffic areas on campus. This, along with campus recycling efforts, is helping make GCC more sustainable. Ms. Garcia introduced herself and reported on GCC's New Student Orientation which includes sharing information in interactive sessions on campus resources, smoking ban, and how students can be successful in academics and in the community. They also offer small group tours and one-on-one time with current students to provide more detailed information on life at GCC. They have had over 25 orientations and served over 2,000 students. Ms. Velez introduced herself and reported on the upcoming Human Library Event scheduled for October 23, 2013. The event includes a human book, human reader, and library space where the human book can share his/her story. Mr. Moran introduced himself and reported overall there has been an increase in GCC events with increased student involvement. Students are an essential part of campus life and they now have over 60 student clubs leading to a path for student leaders to have their own events. He thanked the Board for demonstrating that students are their top priority and concluded the presentation. Board members thanked the students for their presentation.

EMERITUS, AWARDS, AND RECOGNITION

Dr. Linda Lujan, President of Chandler-Gilbert Community College, thanked the Board for its attention and requested Dr. Bill Guerriero, Vice President for Academic Affairs, come forward to present their Faculty Emeritus Award to Dr. Brenda Larson. Dr. Guerriero shared that Dr. Brenda Larson has been an integral part of the CGCC's growth and expansion since its inception as a college. Originally hired to teach Office Automation Systems, Business-Personal Computers, and Computer Information Systems, Dr. Larson modeled the way for faculty professional growth by earning two Master's and doctoral degrees. She helped pioneer a business and teacher education learning community at CGCC's Williams Campus, and was instrumental in launching the college's successful teacher education curriculum. Throughout her 26+ years of service to CGCC and the District, she remained active in a wide range of college and community activities. She served on countless college committees and advisory boards, and maintained partnerships with K-12 and higher education partners including the Colleges of Education at ASU and NAU. During her last year of service, she was chair of the Social and Behavioral Science Division. Dr. Larson was known for her impeccable organization and presentation of course materials, and served as an exemplar for thousands of future teachers.

Dr. Larson thanked the Board for the honor and privilege. She commented that, in her 26 years with Maricopa, she has enjoyed the professional growth opportunities the most. Through them, she was to be involved in service learning, collaborative learning, learning communities, and learn about ongoing studies in brain research, among other topics, because Maricopa helps people stay ahead of the curve.

Dr. Lujan then asked Mr. John Schroeder to come forward to receive his award. Mr. Schroeder first came to Chandler-Gilbert Community College in 1990 as an Aviation Maintenance Technology faculty member and was instrumental in providing current, relevant curriculum and training to countless aviation graduates, who now serve our Valley's aviation and aerospace industry. In 1995 he accepted an opportunity to be involved in business process design and technology planning and support at the Maricopa Community Colleges District Office where he served for eight years as Director of Strategic Information Technologies. In 2003, Mr. Schroeder returned to CGCC as the Provost and Chief Operating Officer for the Williams Campus at the former Williams Field Air Base in Mesa. In that final role, he left an indelible mark on the college and its communities as he worked to keep the rich history of Williams Field alive while leading the transformation of CGCC's portion of the base into a thriving and vibrant campus. Mr. Schroeder not only oversaw the development of every single CGCC building on the site, but brokered partnerships and relationships among other entities, including the federal government; the cities and towns of Mesa, Gilbert, Queen Creek, and Phoenix; ASU Polytechnic; East Valley Institute of Technology; and countless business and industry partners. In this cabinet-level leadership role (equivalent to a Vice President's grade), he contributed in countless ways to the college planning and development, governance, and educational endeavors at all its locations.

Mr. Schroeder echoed what Dr. Larson said about professional growth and said he has had a wonderful time in Maricopa and gotten the opportunity to do various jobs with a chance to impact students. He thanked the Board for the honor.

Dr. Rufus Glasper approached the podium and asked Dr. Don Campbell, retired Board member, to join

him. Dr. Campbell was the recipient of ACCT's 2013 Trustee Leadership Pacific Region Award. Dr. Campbell received a standing ovation as he approached the podium in honor of his many years of service. Dr. Gasper said it was his honor to congratulate Dr. Campbell for receiving the Trustee Leadership award. Dr. Don Campbell was elected to the Maricopa County Community College District Governing Board in 1982. He actively served a twenty-nine year term before retiring in 2012; he served numerous terms as president (1987, 1996, 2001, 2005, 2008), and as secretary (1986, 1995, 2000, 2004, 2007). Dr. Campbell was the first African American trustee within the Maricopa Community College District. As a graduate of Phoenix College, Dr. Campbell is able to relate well to the challenges of being a minority student at the community colleges. Dr. Campbell is well known throughout the Greater Phoenix community as an outstanding proponent of education from pre-K through lifelong learning. He has dedicated his life to helping at-risk children stay in school while focusing on building positive, successful lives. He continues to work with 7th and 8th grade, primarily Hispanic and African American boys weekly after they are out of school to let them know how important they are and to help them develop life goals. Despite devastating challenges, including being orphaned at age twelve, untimely early deaths of his two beloved sons, Dr. Campbell courageously refused to accept defeat and completed his doctorate, served his country proudly in the armed forces, and spent a lifetime inspiring others to succeed.

Dr. Campbell reported that he had intended to go the ACCT 2013 Leadership Congress in Seattle, WA but had to remain behind to take care of his wife who had recently had surgery. He remarked that he had enjoyed his time on the Board and hoped that Maricopa continues to grow and increase the numbers of students served.

CITIZEN'S INTERIM

There were no requests to address the Board.

APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA

President Burke then requested a motion to approve the Order of the Agenda.

Mr. Miranda asked that the Discussion of item **VII.A Response to Citizen Resolution Requests** be postponed until the November Board meeting. Mrs. Pearson asked that Item **V.A.1 Approval of Proposed MCCCDC Board Policy Revisions** be placed on the November agenda as well. Mr. Burke then asked for separate votes on the requests to remove the items from the agenda.

Item VII.A received a 5-0 response and was pulled. Item V.A.1 received a 2-3 vote and was not pulled.

MOTION

Motion 10110

Board Member Saar made a motion to approve the Order of the Agenda, as amended. Board Member Lumm seconded. Motion approved 4-1 (Pearson).

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA

The following items were included in the Consent Agenda:

A1. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 24, 2013 REGULAR BOARD MEETING AND OCTOBER 15, 2013 AGENDA REVIEW

B1. RECOMMENDATION FOR EMERITUS DISTINCTION—CHANDLER-GILBERT COMMUNITY

COLLEGE—recommended that the Governing Board award Emeritus Distinction to Mr. John Schroeder for his meritorious contributions to the students and communities served by the Maricopa Community College District

C1. CONSIDERATION OF EMPLOYMENTS—approve the personnel actions as proposed. Budget approvals have been granted and are on file for the recommended personnel actions in this item.

C2. CONSIDERATION OF SPECIALLY FUNDED EMPLOYMENTS—approve the personnel actions as proposed. Budget approvals have been granted and are on file for the recommended personnel actions in this item.

C3. CONSIDERATION OF SHORT TERM EMPLOYMENTS—approve the personnel actions as proposed. Budget approvals have been granted and are on file for the recommended personnel actions in this item.

C4. CONSIDERATION OF SEPARATIONS—approve the personnel actions as proposed.

C5. CORRECTION TO PREVIOUS BOARD AGENDA ITEMS—recommended that the following personnel actions be approved; budget approvals have been granted and are on file for the recommended personnel actions in this item.

D1. APPROVAL OF CURRICULUM—recommend that the proposal be approved as submitted.

D2. APPROVAL OF PROPOSED INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY OF SCOTTSDALE—approve a no cost Intergovernmental Agreement between Maricopa County Community College District and the City of Scottsdale Fire Department to provide internship opportunities (ride-alongs).

E1. APPROVAL OF PHOENIX PARK AND SWAP CONTRACT—approve contract between Maricopa County Community College District (“MCCCD”), a political subdivision of the State of Arizona, on behalf of Gateway Community College (“College”) and AMERICAN PARK ‘N SWAP, INC, d/b/a Phoenix Park ‘n Swap (“APS”), an Arizona Corporation, with offices located at 40 Fountain Plaza, Buffalo, New York 14202. This agreement will be for the current fiscal year with the option for five additional one-year renewal terms.

E2. APPROVAL OF PROPOSED COURSE FEE CHANGES FY2013-14—approve the varied fee changes detailed on the attached. These changes relate to both common fees and course fees at several colleges across the District, detailed by college.

E3. APPROVAL OF WATERLINE EASEMENT TO THE CITY OF PHOENIX ALONG 15TH AVENUE AT PHOENIX COLLEGE—grant an easement to the City of Phoenix to abandon and relocate a fire hydrant along 15th Avenue, directly adjacent to the existing parking structure at Phoenix College.

E4. APPROVAL OF AWARD OF CONTRACT FOR INSURANCE BROKERAGE AND RISK MANAGEMENT CONSULTANT SERVICES—approve the award of a contract for insurance and risk management consultant services to Arthur J. Gallagher Risk Management Services, Inc. for the period December 31, 2013 to December 30, 2014 with an additional four one-year options available for a total contract period not to exceed five years.

E5. APPROVAL OF PROPOSED REVISED LANGUAGE OF FISCAL YEAR 2013-14 TUITION AND FEE SCHEDULE—approve the revised descriptive language to the Adopted Tuition and Fee Schedule for FY2013-14. The purpose is to clarify which tuition rate applies when a student is both eligible to participate in the Western Undergraduate Exchange Program, and is taking an MCCD distance learning class as a non-resident out of state student. In this case the lower Western Undergraduate Exchange (WUE) Program Rate would be charged. This is a difference of \$121.50 per credit hour for WUE rate versus \$215 per credit hour for Distance Learning for Out of State Resident.

E6. APPROVAL OF LICENSE AGREEMENT WITH GRAND CANYON UNIVERISTY (GCU)—approve an office space license agreement with GCU, for GCU to maintain an office at Paradise Valley Community College from November 1, 2013 through June 30, 2014. With approval of both parties this agreement is subject to renewal, beginning on July 1st through June 30.

MOTION

Motion 10111

President Burke asked for approval of the Consent Agenda. Board Member Saar moved for approval of the Consent Agenda. Board Member Lumm seconded. Motion was approved 5-0.

V.A.1 APPROVAL OF PROPOSED MCCCD BOARD POLICY REVISIONS—adopt the proposed changes to its Governance Policies.

Mrs. Pearson stated that one thing in the governance policy that has been discussed and still needs to be put into policy is dealing with a hostile work environment. The policy needs to provide the

Chancellor with how the Board expects it to be addressed and measured. There was nothing put in place that creates the proper requirements or acknowledgement of statutory requirements and doesn't provide a means to measure. The Board cannot hold the Chancellor accountable for something without clear language and interpretation. What stands now allows no measure because it isn't defined. Without that discussion, the Board cannot come to any kind of agreement. This has been an issue for many years and each time it is clear there is no Board policy to address it and no clear relationship to the situation. The statute is very clear on this requirement of the Board. She also remarked that she did not feel that consideration was not put forward regarding some of the comments put forth by other Board members. She clearly wants to see in the recommended changes what the problem was, what is being fixed, and why.

Dr. Glasper responded by saying that members of the Board have spent a number of hours discussing the policy and ample opportunity was made for Board members to participate. Mrs. Pearson remarked the Board has been told in the past that if it wanted to have a conversation about hostile work environment there needs to be a Board policy. Dr. Glasper said that the current changes to **2.2 Treatment of Faculty and Staff** attempted to address this concern by adding the language regarding following all applicable local, state, and federal requirements. Mrs. Pearson said the Board has a statutory responsibility to the work environment. The policy states MCCCDC will follow the law but Board policy needs to state specifically what the Board requires regarding a hostile work environment. She reiterated that the Board has a direct responsibility to the work environment and it should have a position as a Board on hostile work environment. Another Board member remarked that grievances and how they should be addressed are outlined in the policy manual and allows for employees to deal with the situation. Mrs. Pearson remarked that this conversation would be better to be had in a Work Session. Mr. Lumm recommended the Board continue to pass the existing changes and make new changes as necessary. HE said the Board had created the best policies it could with strong commitment from the Chancellor. He asked the Chancellor if there was something missing from the language that affects his ability to respond to this issue. Dr. Glasper reminded the Board that his interpretations of Board policy still needs to come back to the Board. Measurements would be included in those interpretations and could be addressed at that time.

Mrs. Pearson stated she would give the Chancellor's Interpretations an opportunity to address the cancerous situation which has existed for many years. She said she had been under the impression that the Chancellor had been lacking a policy to be able to enforce the situation. Mr. Miranda said he kept hearing the words retaliation and hostile environment and stated that Employee Relations needed to come forward to discuss the issue with the Board. The topic needs to be revisited and he was willing to make a specific commitment to revisit in a short time. Mrs. Pearson thanked Mr. Miranda for his commitment. Mrs. Pearson declared that Maricopa needs to become a place that champions inclusiveness, shared knowledge, and consequences.

Dr. Glasper remarked that, in light of the discussion and pending the Board's response to pending Interpretations, he would like to have item **V.C.2 Approval of Chancellor's Contract of Employment 2013-2016** pulled until later. Mr. Burke asked that discussion of this be held until the item was under discussion.

MOTION

Motion 10112

Governing Board Member Saar moved for approval of Action Item V.A.1. Board Member Lumm seconded. Motion was approved 4-1 (Pearson).

V.B.1 APPROVAL OF ARCHITECTURE CONSULTANT SELECTION FOR ALLIED HEALTH AND DENTAL PROGRAM REMODEL AT 3144 N 7TH AVENUE, PHOENIX, AZ FOR PHOENIX COLLEGE—approve the selection of DLR Group to provide architectural and engineering consulting services for the Allied Health and Dental Program remodeling for Phoenix College at 3144 N 7th Ave Phoenix, AZ, with a not-to-exceed fee of \$774,795, including reimbursable expenses.

MOTION

Motion 10113

Governing Board Member Saar moved for approval of Action Item V.B.1. Board Member Lumm seconded. Motion was approved 5-0.

V.B.2 APPROVAL OF FINAL GUARANTEED MAXIMUM PRICE CONTRACT AMENDMENT FOR THE NEW PERFORMING ARTS CENTER AT ESTRELLA MOUNTAIN COMMUNITY COLLEGE—approve a second Contract Amendment to an existing Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) agreement for a not-to-exceed amount of Nine Million Six Hundred Eighty Thousand and no/100ths Dollars (\$9,680,000.00) to Adolfson & Peterson Construction to establish the Guaranteed Maximum Price (GMP) for the construction of the Performing Arts Center at Estrella Mountain Community College.

MOTION**Motion 10114**

Governing Board Member Lumm moved for approval of Action Item V.B.2. Board Member Miranda seconded. Motion was approved 5-0.

V.B.3 APPROVAL OF CONCEPTUAL APPROVAL FOR REMODELING IN THE TECHNOLOGY 3/AUTOMOTIVE BUILDING AT GLENDALE COMMUNITY COLLEGE—provide Conceptual Approval for remodeling in the Technology 3-Automotive Building (T-3) at Glendale Community College with a Total Project Budget of \$7,523,313.00.

MOTION**Motion 10115**

Governing Board Member Lumm moved for approval of Action Item V.B.3. Board Member Saar seconded. Motion was approved 5-0.

V.B.4 APPROVAL OF JOB ORDER CONTRACTING PURCHASE ORDER REMODELING AT THE EXISTING PERFORMING ARTS CENTER (PAC) BUILDING AT GLENDALE COMMUNITY COLLEGE—approve a Job Order Contract (JOC) purchase order in the amount of Six Hundred Eighty-Five Thousand Three Hundred Eighty-One Dollars and 98/100ths (\$685,381.98) to Caliente Construction for remodeling in the Performing Arts Center (PAC) at Glendale Community College.

MOTION**Motion 10116**

Governing Board Member Lumm moved for approval of Action Item V.B.4. Board Member Miranda seconded. Motion was approved 5-0.

V.C.1 APPROVAL OF REVISION TO STAFF POLICY MANUAL AND REPEAL OF CHANCELLOR'S EXECUTIVE COUNCIL ("CEC") POLICY MANUAL—approve the revisions to Sections A-1, A-20, A-29, B-5 and B-7 and the addition of Appendix G, Maricopa and EMCC Southwest Skill Centers Policy Manual, as revised, to the Staff Policy Manual. These revisions are shown in legislative format on the attached documents. It is further recommended that the Governing Board approve repealing the CEC Policy Manual.

MOTION**Motion 10117**

Governing Board Member Saar moved for approval of Action Item V.C.1. Board Member Lumm seconded. Motion was approved 4-1 (Pearson).

Mrs. Pearson stated for the record she felt there were some good pieces to this change such as the inclusion of the Skill Center employees to recognize them as fully fledged employees of the District. Unfortunately, it is attached to a document that she feels was not truly conducted using Interest Based Negotiation (IBN). She said the entire manual needs to be revisited in a more inclusive manner by staff. She felt that, since the baseline document is faulty, it puts the rest of these changes in an inappropriate place.

V.C.2 APPROVAL OF CHANCELLOR'S CONTRACT OF EMPLOYMENT 2013-2016—approve the proposed Chancellor's Contract of Employment for a three year term. The Contract is dated October 22, 2013.

Dr. Glasper asked the item be pulled from consideration until the Board has a chance to respond to the Chancellor Interpretations that have yet to be submitted. Board members quickly responded their support of the Chancellor and his work. Dr. Glasper remarked that is just good practice to wait to verify that he can agree to all terms presented. President Burke reiterated the Chancellor's interest in waiting until he received feedback from the Board on the Interpretations before he felt he could move forward with a contract. After some additional discussion, President Burke made a motion to postpone action on this item until the November Meeting.

MOTION**Motion 10118**

Governing Board Member Burke moved for removal of Action Item V.C.2. Board Member Saar seconded. Motion was approved 5-0

V.D.1 APPROVAL OF STUDENT INFORMATION SYSTEM FINANCIAL AID REGULATION SUPPORT— approve the award and expenditure of \$646,000.00 (Six hundred and forty-six thousand Dollars) under RFP 2977-10 Oracle/PeopleSoft Enterprise System Consulting and Related Services to ensure that Maricopa remains in compliance with State and Federal Financial Aid updates, and has the ability to disperse funds, while planning continues for a major upgrade to the Student Information System (Oracle/PeopleSoft V8.9) (“SIS”).

MOTION**Motion 10119**

Governing Board Member Saar moved for approval of Action Item V.D.1. Board Member Pearson seconded. Motion was approved 5-0.

MONITORING REPORTS

VI.A BUDGET ANALYSIS REPORT, FUND 1—GENERAL UNRESTRICTED FUND FOR THE TWELVE MONTHS ENDING JUNE 30, 2013 FINAL—UNAUDITED—Expenditure analysis indicates 91.6% of the budget has been expended this year as compared to 90.2% expended at this same point last year. 8.4% of the budget remained unexpended or unencumbered compared to 9.8% in the prior year. Revenue analysis indicated that 97.6% of the budget has been recognized as compared to 98.5% in the prior year. The fund balance increased by ~\$5.2M this fiscal year.

VI.B BUDGET ANALYSIS REPORT, FUND 1—GENERAL UNRESTRICTED FUND FOR THE THREE MONTHS ENDING SEPTEMBER 30, 2013—Expenditure analysis indicates 19.3% of the budget has been expended this year as compared to 19.3% expended at this same point last year. 36.0% of the budget remained unexpended or unencumbered compared to 36.5% in the prior year. Revenue analysis indicated that 26.3% of the budget has been recognized as compared to 26.7% in the prior year. The projected fund balance will increase by ~\$3.6M this fiscal year and the projected ending fund balance for June 2014 is \$161.1M.

VI.C 2004 GENERAL OBLIGATION BONDS, SERIES A (2005), SERIES B (2007), SERIES C (2009) SERIES D (2011), AND SERIES 2013, 2004 CAPITAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN SUMMARY AS OF JUNE 30, 2013 (FINAL)—As of June 30, 2013, \$757.5 million, representing approximately 80% of proceeds from the Series A, Series B, Series C, Series D, and Series 2013 issuances of the 2004 bond have been expended or encumbered and \$193.8 million remains available. Bond proceeds are invested until expended.

VI.D 2004 GENERAL OBLIGATION BONDS, SERIES A (2005), SERIES B (2007), SERIES C (2009) SERIES D (2011), AND SERIES 2013, 2004 CAPITAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN SUMMARY AS OF SEPTEMBER 30, 2013—As of September 30, 2013, \$769.4 million, representing approximately 81% of proceeds from the Series A, Series B, Series C, Series D, and Series 2013 issuances of the 2004 bond have been expended or encumbered and \$181.9 million remains available. Bond proceeds are invested until expended.

BOARD MEMBER REPORTS

The Board members began their individual reports with an update on their participation in the 2013 ACCT Leadership Congress in Seattle, WA on October 2-5, 2013. Written reports are provided as Appendix items to these minutes. Individual reports will follow.

- Mr. Saar reported that ACCT publishes all handout materials for all events on their website and encouraged anyone interested to check them out (www.acct.org).
- Mrs. Pearson reported she enjoyed the educational opportunities and learned a lot especially about sustainability. She said she particularly enjoyed the symposium and felt that the amount of support from the Gates Foundation for the symposium was phenomenal. She learned that community colleges need to recognize they are losing focus by trying to become university systems (especially regarding costs). By doing that, community colleges lose their differences, their ability to change and meet the needs of the community. She also learned there is a lot of frustration about why community colleges are abandoning their child care facilities. The feeling is that baseline assessments were measuring the wrong things and parents without childcare were losing out on the chance to go to school. She reported that Maricopa now has the opportunity to

be part of the ACCT Senate, having elected Mr. Saar to the Board. This gives Maricopa a voice in the work that ACCT is doing. It's a huge time commitment and she thanked Mr. Saar for his willingness to serve. She also wanted to acknowledge the work done by APIA and Native American groups who were responsible for the performances at the Congress.

- Mr. Miranda reported he was surprised by the immensity of the Congress. He focused on the tracks concerning developmental education, which he feels is a challenge for all community colleges. He hopes next year Maricopa can present on the great work it is doing for developmental education. He said it was surprising that technology tracks were missing from the Congress presentations and feels Maricopa could lead the way there with a presentation next year dealing with that gigantic issue.
- Mr. Lumm shared some of the insights his panel group presented at their session, "Trustee Support of Latino Student Success: A National Perspective" at the Congress. Copies of the slides are included at the end of the minutes, as well.
- Mr. Burke remarked he attended many sessions, including the symposium. Topics he focused on were ways to achieve student success, change policies, performance funding, and use of technology in higher education. He was fortunate to hear Bill Gates speak. Mr. Gates made a point sure to give faculty some pause—he recommended colleges develop a course by a highly effective professor and use technology and online courses to supplement teaching. President Burke also acknowledged the Mr. Lumm was elected to the Personnel Committee for the Pacific Region. Arizona trustees came together in a special meeting to discuss advocacy. He then reiterated that written reports would be made available with the minutes.

Mr. Saar reported that he also recently attended the National Association for Community College Entrepreneurship (NACCE) 2013 Conference in Charlotte, NC, October 13-16, 2013, and enjoyed it very much. He congratulated SMCC for picking up a \$15,000 grant in a very competitive grant process. He spent time in the leadership track and learned a new word—effectuation. Next year, NACCE is being held in Phoenix and is hosted by MCCC (RSC, Corporate College, and SMCC). He encouraged everyone to attend.

President Burke provided the following. "The past few weeks, I attended the ACCT Conference in Seattle, WA, and a conference on Digital Learning sponsored by McKinsey & Company in San Francisco, the latter by invitation. My report on the ACCT Conference is part of tonight's minutes, and I will prepare a report on the Digital Learning conference for our web page. To prepare for that conference, I enjoyed meeting with faculty, staff, and administration at MCC, Rio, and PC, as well as John Webster in our IT office. I also attended the Heroes of Education Dinner Kick-Off at the Sheraton in Phoenix."

CHANCELLOR'S REPORT

Chancellor Rufus Glasper said he would like to update the Board on the Maricopa Priorities and Performance Based Funding Projects. Dr. Glasper then introduced Ms. Debbie Thompson, Vice Chancellor of Business Services, to provide the update.

Ms. Thompson began by speaking about the inception of the project with a Chancellor-hosted daylong seminar in May, 2012, where staff learned about prioritization of programs and services. A steering team was pulled together afterward to develop a process for Maricopa to engage in over the next 18 months.

Mission of Maricopa Priorities

- To develop and implement a reflective process through which we can assess current areas of educational excellence.
- To help realign resources...to meet community needs and advance the mission of the Maricopa Community College District.

Purpose of Maricopa Priorities

- To examine and assess all current instructional and support programs and services.
- To explore their origins and how they have evolved.
- To determine how they serve the community's changing educational needs, to evaluate whether they are positioned to meet the educational requirements of our communities.
- By prioritizing programs and services primarily based on demands, expectations, and outcomes, we can align our efforts and resources to focus on maintaining, improving, and building programs and centers of excellence that will substantially contribute to student success.

Goal of Maricopa Priorities

- The goal of Maricopa Priorities is to align our efforts and resources so that we can focus on maintaining, improving, and building programs and centers of excellence that will substantially contribute to student success.

Context: Why / Why Now?

- We are advancing ONE Maricopa as an organizational approach and vision.
- We've learned through the Great Recession that resources truly are limited and that significant financial losses can occur.
- As such, we need to optimize our resource use to best serve our community...we can't all do everything...or at least all do everything well.

Process: College / District Office

- All programs and services complete self-assessments.
- Local task forces (instructional or support services) review & make recommendations to local steering team.
- Local steering teams review & make recommendations to local champion (CEC member).
- Local steering team forwards final recommendations to the Maricopa Priorities Steering Team, and the champion may append these with their own comments or recommendations.

Self-Assessments

- Uniform templates for instructional and support services
- Rubric provided for scoring
- Examples of information to provide
- Templates qualitative and quantitative—some data provided by district
- Program/service area leaders should engage the group in the process
- Sign-off by a supervisor/manager required
- Completed May 2, 2014

Recommendation Options (Due September 14, 2014)

- Expand
- Enhance
- Maintain
- Restructure
- Consolidate
- Reduce
- Phase Out Over Time
- Eliminate in the Near Term

Champion (Due September 19, 2014)

- Prior to forwarding the final recommendation to the Maricopa Priorities Steering Team, local steering teams should discuss recommendations at length with champion and consider, as appropriate, their input.
- Champions may append their own recommendations or perspectives.

Maricopa Priorities Steering Team (Due December 3, 2014)

- Will review summaries of all college recommendations and make recommendations to CEC for systemic approaches, which may or may not have come from individual college/district office recommendations.

Implementation

- Some recommendations could begin when the task force/steering recommendations are made.
- Others may take longer to implement if policy action is needed or systemic action is needed.
- Could take several years to implement.
- In the spirit of continuous improvement, this will be an iterative systemic process. Applying lessons learned, a new cycle can be expected in 3-5 years to continue holistic reviews and realignments.

Other Important Points

- Training (in Canvas and in person).
- Maricopa Priorities Steering Team will serve as a process resource and there will be varied system resources for data.
- Communication will be on-going.

Board members asked what the time frame for Maricopa Priorities is. Ms. Thompson responded that groups were training now, organizing task forces, and self-assessments would need to be completed within the next few weeks. Assessments would be reviewed by supervisors and managers and completed in March, 2014. Final drafts are due by May 2, 2014. From May, 2014 to September 5, 2014, Task Force work. Final recommendations due September 19, 2014.

Performance Based Funding History

- Getting AHEAD 2010-2011
- ACCPC Strategic Vision 2020 (www.arizonacommunitycolleges.org)
- Lumina Grant 2012-2013
 - State
 - Maricopa

Goal Statement

Arizona's Community Colleges are the largest higher education provider in the State, the largest provider of workforce training and the largest source of transfer students to our public universities. The goal of Performance Funding for Arizona Community Colleges is to improve student outcomes and success by incenting improvements in institutional performance that will result in more educated and trained communities throughout the State.

Guiding Principles

- **Quality:** the model should direct resources to enhance the quality of the educational experience and result in improvements in institutional performance, especially student outcomes, progress and overall success.
- **Simple:** the funding model should be easy to understand,
- **Transparent:** stakeholders must know completely what the model is and how it is used.
- **Objective:** the model should be as much of an objective calculation (algorithmic) as possible to minimize subjectivity and inequitable application.
- **Predictable:** the models should not allow shifts in funding to occur more frequently than institutional leaders reasonably can be expected to respond.
- **Reliable:** the model should be based on data that can be verified and replicated.
- **Flexible:** the model should reflect the unique characteristics of each district and be assessed and adjusted.
- **Balanced:** the model should achieve strategic balance among competing guiding principles.

Performance Based Budgeting Proposal (to AZ State Legislature)

- 3-year pilot
- Evaluation annually for technical issues
- Major evaluation after year 3
- Based on core metrics identified by the ACCC

Core Metrics

- Success after Remediation
 - After Developmental Math
 - After Developmental English/Reading
- Course Success Rate
 - Developmental
 - College Level
- Fall to Fall Retention
- Degree / Certification (Graduation) Rate

- Transfer with AGEC and/or Associates Degree
- Percent of Learners Achieving a Successful Community College Outcome

Formula

- For Attainment and Improvement
- Max of 20 (10) each for attainment and improvement in each metric
- Points awarded based on tercile bands
- Points totaled for each district
- Totals adjusted by FTSE share
- Percentage applied to new State funding for performance

Next Steps

The Maricopa Model adds Developmental Educational and Developing Colleges as factors

Mrs. Pearson remarked that concerns brought forth to the Performance Based Funding (PBF) model, issue seem to have merit. After her participation in the ACCT Symposium, which addressed PBF, who's doing it, and why, she was really struck by the idea that Ms. Thompson and Dr. Glasper are putting MCCCDC out in front on this issue. While she acknowledged the concerns of the model, the wave is for this to continue. Maricopa has some very committed people who will address any possible down sides before they can occur. Mr. Lumm stated there seemed to be some fear that the self-assessments would result in defunding. He asked what additional considerations, besides the assessments, were being looked at. Ms. Thompson replied that training is addressing such concerns and being clear that Dr. Glasper has not placed any targets on this work. The focus is not about meeting targets but about making Maricopa better. Mr. Saar asked for clarification on how deep the group will go when making recommendations—to the course level, for example. Ms. Thompson replied it is still being looked at, although a course by course review would not be possible—too many considerations. Mr. Lumm asked if PBF is only for state funds or would it be used for taxes and tuition. Ms. Thompson clarified it would only be for state funding. Mr. Lumm said community colleges are open access and receive students who are experimenting or who may not be ready to focus on a single goal. He asked how those students' needs can be met without funding being affected. Ms. Thompson said MCCCDC is proposing funding also be based on enrollment to address the open access issues. Then the focus would shift to attainment and improvements to cover Districts that do really well while others make progress. Mr. Miranda remarked the challenge of PBF is that it seems to reward those who do well and penalize those who don't. Ms. Thompson said that is why MCCCDC is proposing a pilot with the ability to make technical changes each year.

FACULTY REPORT

Dr. Patricia Finkenstadt, President of the Faculty Executive Council, reported on the Maricopa Colleges Faculty Foundation which raised \$37,000 in 2013 to support students with urgent financial needs. Such needs include transportation costs, school supplies, rent, food, utilities, etc. These mini grants are usually awarded within 48-hours of application and are designed to help students stay in school when urgent needs crop up. They are pursuing partnerships with other non-profits to help students succeed.

EMPLOYEE GROUP REPORTS

Mr. Ted Georgas, President of the Crafts Employee Group, remarked that he can personally state he has been a part of many of the processes described during the meeting this night, including IBN and Maricopa Priorities. He said he has worked in a lot of places and been at Maricopa for some time and he's never had the opportunity to do as many things as he can do at Maricopa. He thanked the Board. He then said, on behalf of the Unified Crafts Association, it was his privilege to make a donation to the Maricopa Foundation on behalf of the Provost and Executive Vice Chancellor, Dr. Maria Harper-Marinick, who accepted the donation.

VICE CHANCELLOR REPORTS

Dr. Steven Helfgot, CEO of the Maricopa Foundation, provided the following. "Mr. Burke, members of the Board, along with my colleagues, President Gehler and President Kovala, I am pleased to share with you this evening one example of an approach to scholarships at the Maricopa Community Colleges Foundation that results in positive outcomes for students, for donors, for the Foundation, and for relationships with our community. For a number of years the Foundation has worked with community organizations and businesses to create matching scholarships. These are just what you might imagine: a donor provides a certain number of scholarships at a certain dollar amount and the Foundation—

with our admittedly limited unrestricted dollars—matches each scholarship. The award to the student is doubled, each organization sees its money leveraged, and strong partnerships result. \$66,000 in matching scholarships were awarded in 2012-2013 and so far in 2013-2014 we've awarded \$44,000 in matching scholarship money. A number of these scholarships—like the one I am about to describe—are awarded at major community events, highlighting our students, our colleges, and the work of our Foundation. And, tangentially, these partnerships have resulted in two individuals becoming members of the Foundation Board, one of whom has gone on to serve as Board Chair. The example we share with you tonight is not the biggest of these partnerships nor the oldest, but it provides a nice snapshot of how they work and provides an opportunity for you to meet some students who have benefitted. For seven years, Univision Radio has sponsored the annual "40 Hispanic Leaders Under 40" luncheon. Several years ago, Chery Milovic, Univision Radio's National Account Manager (and now Foundation Board member), the driving force behind the 40 Under 40 program, came to us and asked how we might collaborate to build an emphasis on education into the 40 Under 40 program. Together we developed the idea of an emerging leaders recognition at the luncheon in which four (and someday maybe more) Hispanic student leaders at Maricopa Community Colleges would be recognized and awarded matching scholarships, \$1,000 each from Univision or one of its sponsors (this year, Univision, Valle del Sol, Cox Communications, and Wells Fargo) and \$1,000 each from the Foundation. This year, two of those student leaders came from Scottsdale Community College and two from Glendale Community College. And with that I am happy now to call on Dr. Gehler, who will introduce her students and give them a chance to say a few words; she will be followed by Dr. Kovala who will do the same and then I will close."

Dr. Jan Gehler, President of Scottsdale Community College, introduced Mr. Aaron Torres, Latino Student Club Association advisor, to introduce the scholarship winners. Mr. Torres said it was his privilege to introduce Ms. Miriam Villanueva and Mr. Francisco Dominguez.

Ms. Miriam Villanueva is a passionate, dedicated and forward thinking student. Miriam was the secretary of SCC's student government, Student Leadership Forum (SLF) as a new student. The following year she became SLF's Special Events Co-Manager. Currently, you will find her as vice president for both the Latino Student Association and Artie's Community for Service. Miriam is a graduate of the Maricopa Community Colleges LeaderShape Institute and works at SCC's Center for Civic and Global Engagement. Miriam's career goal is to become a nurse.

Mr. Francisco Dominguez is an extraordinary student leader at Scottsdale Community College (SCC). He is currently pursuing an Associates of Arts and holds a 3.5 GPA. His educational goals are to transfer to a university and major in English. His post-graduate plans are to attend law school. He is currently an officer in the Latino Student Association at SCC and a member of SCC's Male Empowerment /Minority Male Initiative (M.E.N./MMI) as well as participating in the Student Leadership Forum for the past two years. He is dedicated to promoting awareness of Hispanic issues and creating a culture of success among his peers. This year, he has been instrumental in organizing and implementing the Hispanic Heritage Month events at SCC.

Ms. Villanueva thanked the Foundation and Univision for the award. She thanked SCC for giving her the tools she needed to further her education. She plans to give back through the community. Mr. Dominguez thanked MCCC and Valle del Sol for his award to further his education. He also thanked Mr. Torres, saying he had played an instrumental role by giving him advice and pushing him to succeed.

Dr. Irene Kovala, President of Glendale Community College, invited her two scholarship recipients, Ms. Karla Resparido and Mr. GGerardo McNeal, forward to speak.

Ms. Karla Resparido has worked tirelessly to promote and maintain the GCC MechA student organization, facilitated Hispanic cultural events and activities for the college community at large and mentored new students within her organization to help them achieve their academic goals. Karla has served as a board member and Vice President's Aide within the GCC Associated Student Government. Karla is also an active member of the college's Judicial Review Board and a New Student Orientation Leader (NSO). Within NSO she facilitated New Student Orientation and provided pertinent information to the new student population. While keeping busy with student activities, Karla has managed to maintain an exceptional grade point average.

Mr. Gerardo McNeal was raised in a single parent household and is a first generation college student. He has worked tirelessly to maintain academic excellence at GCC while working part-time to fund his studies as well as volunteering at an elder care facility. He has balanced all of this because he is well-rounded, ambitious, capable, focused and determined to reach his goals.

Ms. Respardo thanked MCCCDC and Wells Fargo for her award which will help her pay for her tuition and books. She is also happily planning to transfer to PVCC to complete their Registered Dietetics program. She said the 40 Under 40 dinner was very motivational and thanked the Board for allowing her to be a part of it. Mr. McNeal stated he felt the scholarship was not just financial aid but it was MCCCDC standing behind him and supporting his career goals.

Dr. Helfgot concluded his remarks. "In closing, I want to congratulate again these four students who are representative of dozens of others who have won matching scholarships. I want to thank Dr. Gehler and Dr. Kovala and I want to thank all of you for your support of the work that we do in support of our colleges and, most importantly, our students."

Dr. Maria Harper-Marinick, Executive Vice Chancellor and Provost, said she would like to welcome the 2013 participants in the Women's Leadership Group Mentorship program to the meeting. She said the program started in 2000 and was created to provide leadership training to the women of Maricopa. To date, they have had over 340 people in the program. There were 28 participants this year. She asked them to stand and be recognized and then thanked them for participating and thanked the colleges for supporting the program.

COLLEGE REPORTS

Dr. Paul Dale, President of Paradise Valley Community College, introduced Ms. Felicia Ramirez to provide an update on PVCC's Innovation in General Education Learning Outcomes Assessment.

Step #1: Faculty identify learning outcomes

- Course competencies
- Recognize a challenge
- Improve general education
- Program review
- Collaborate with colleagues

General Education Learning Outcomes

- Critical Thinking
- Diversity and Global Awareness
- Information Literacy
- Oral Communication
- Problem Solving
- Technology
- Written Communication
- [Working now to add Critical Reading to this list]

General Education Assessment (GEA) Rubrics

- Customizable
- Mix and Match Dimensions
- Best Practices
- Common Learning Language
- Interdisciplinary

GEA Online Tool

- Uses MEID to login
- Reporting Forms
- Data Collection & Tracking
- Results Analysis
- Completed Assessments Database

Step #2: Develop Plan, Implement, and Report

- All online
- Accessible throughout the year

Step #3: Gather and Report Data

- Connected to (SIS) Student Information System
- Automatically generates results

Step #4: Analyze Results, Make Changes, Report

- Faculty can access results
- Results tell different stories

Step #5: Continue Learning and Working to Improve Learning

- View assessments of colleagues
- Division Chair assessment form
- Common assessments in department
- Conversations to improve learning
- CAT participation

CAT: Critical Thinking Assessment Test

- PVCC Score—17.00
- Community Colleges Score—13.48
- Lower Division 4 Year Score—13.66

Learning Centered Assessment

- Intuitive
- Practical & User Friendly
- Promotes Meaningful Discussion
- Encourages Collaboration
- Demonstrates learning at multiple levels-Student, Employee, Organizational

Board members asked if other colleges were doing something similar. Dr. Glasper yes, but they are not using the same tool. Mr. Lumm asked if this was mandatory for instructors at PVCC. Ms. Ramirez said the faculty agreed to complete the course assessment projects or general education projects but how they do this is their choice. Dr. Dale said the nature of the tool makes it very easy to use and complete general education assessment and the choice of practices allows it to be more holistic. Mr. Lumm asked how things are chosen. Ms. Ramirez said it depended on what instructors were seeing in the classroom and the tool allows them to pick a particular area to highlight. Inspiration comes from many areas and the process allows faculty to be inspired by whatever they want to work on. They be changing an approach or trying a new activity. This provides an opportunity to constantly improve themselves. Mr. Miranda asked if the process was different for online courses. Ms. Ramirez said the assessments allow faculty to help students more, no matter what format.

AADGB REPORT

President Burke reported “The Arizona Association of District Governing Boards is planning a meeting of Arizona community college trustees at the Arizona Commission of Postsecondary Education conference, which will occur on November 21-22, 2013. This meeting will be the first of an annual get-together for trustees. AADGB is the also working with the Association of Community College Trustees to help either a Governing Board Leadership Institute or a Government Institute in Student Success in 2014.”

ASBA REPORT

Mr. Saar reported the annual conference was coming up in December with much the same format as the Law Conference. He invited those interested to attend.

LEGISLATIVE UPDATE

There was no report.

NEXT BOARD MEETINGS

President Burke announced the following future meetings:

- November 12, 2013, 4:00 p.m., Agenda Review, Rio Conference Center

- November 12, 2013, 6:00 p.m., Annual Outcomes Retreat, Rio Conference Center
- November 26, 2013 3:00 p.m., Agenda Review, Governing Board Room
- November 26, 2013, 6:30 p.m., Regular Board Meeting, Governing Board Room

ADJOURNMENT

President Burke adjourned the regular board meeting at 9:29 p.m.

Dana G. Saar
Governing Board Secretary